

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE - JUNE 20, 2005

REQUEST FOR DESIGNATION UNDER THE ONTARIO HERITAGE ACT OF THE GRAHAM HOUSE, 9933 DUFFERIN STREET

Recommendation

The Commissioner of Community Services, in consultation with the Director of Recreation & Culture recommends:

1. That the structure at 9933 Dufferin Street, identified as the Graham House, be designated for its cultural heritage value under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act.

Economic Impact

There is no financial impact to undertake the proposed Designation request. Funds for the proposed designation (which includes advertising and other administrative costs) will be funded through the Heritage Vaughan 2005 Operating Budget.

Purpose

The purpose of this report is to seek approval to initiate the Designation of the Graham House, 9933 Dufferin Street, in Block 11, Lot 20, Concession 2, under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act.

Background - Analysis and Options

The structure identified as the Graham House, 9933 Dufferin Street, located at the south-east corner of Major Mackenzie Drive and Dufferin Street (Block 11), has been identified by Cultural Services staff and the Heritage Vaughan committee as having cultural heritage value. The incorporation of the building in the proposed development plan, (draft plan of subdivision 19T-95065) for the property was recommended by Culture Staff to the Planning Department as part of the Block Plan process in 2002. A Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment Report was requested from the owner in an effort to assess the buildings on the property and identify mitigation opportunities for preservation of buildings deemed significant. A "Preliminary" Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment was submitted by the owner to Cultural Services staff in December 2004. The Assessment Report identifies the building as having significant heritage value and recommends preservation and inclusion of the building in the proposed Plan of Subdivision development for the property.

In May 2005, as a result of the structure being left vacant and unsecured, the building sustained extensive interior damage by vandals. Most of its interior architectural details such as doors, mantels and staircases were removed. The exterior of the building, however, retains most of its original architectural features and is considered in relatively good condition.

A Property Standards Order was issued on the property and the owner has complied by boarding and securing the structural openings of the buildings.

The Graham House has significant heritage value for its architectural style. The structure was built in two phases: the original north portion was built between 1860 and 1875 and the remaining new south additions circa 1920. The building has an "H" floor plan and original slate roof. The north (original) portion of the building is Georgian in style and the later additions were built in the Classical/Colonial Revival style in the early part of the 20th century.

While the structure and general maintenance has been neglected by the owner, the building is a good example of a Georgian style house with semi-circular dormer and warrants preservation under the Ontario Heritage Act. (See Attachment 1 for a complete "Reasons for Designation" report.)

Heritage Vaughan committee at its meeting of 18 May, 2005 reviewed the Heritage Impact Assessment report on the Graham House and recommended that the property be Designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act. The Designation of the property is being recommended in order to preserve this building on the property and ensure it can be incorporated in the new development proposed for the site.

The main function of Heritage Vaughan as assigned to the committee by the Ontario Heritage Act is to advise Council on local heritage matters and assist in carrying out the City's heritage conservation program. Cultural Services Division provides technical and administrative support to Heritage Vaughan committee.

The functions of the committee also includes the following:

- Determines the value of heritage resources for protection through designation under the Ontario Heritage Act; Part IV designation (individual property) or Part V designation (area designation as a heritage conservation district).
- Reviews development applications impacting heritage buildings and provides recommendations on preservation measures for these buildings.
- Promotes heritage conservation within the community.
- Administers the Designated Property Grant Program.
- Educates the community to encourage the responsible stewardship of the community's heritage assets.

The Ontario Heritage Act allows municipal councils to designate individual buildings and or property or cultural heritage significance under Part IV of the Act. The Designation process would entail, if approved by Council, a notification of Council's intention issued to the property owner, the Ontario Heritage Foundation and the general public through the advertising of Council's intention in the local paper. Should any objections or appeals to the designation be served on the City Clerk within thirty days of a notice being published in the local paper, those objections will be referred to the Ontario Municipal Board for a hearing. The OMB decision on the matter will be the final decision on the Designation.

The Designation of property under the Ontario Heritage Act would require that no changes to the exterior of the building take place without Council's approval. Also, the demolition of Designated property without a permit could result in the imposition of fines up to \$50,000 to individual property owners and up to \$1 million dollars to corporations.

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2007

Section 4.6 of the Vaughan Vision encourages the preservation and enhancement of the natural and built heritage environment and encourages the preservation of significant historical structures and communities.

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council and the necessary resources to implement all points outlined in this report have been allocated and approved.

Conclusion

The Graham House, located at 9933 Dufferin Street, Block 11, at the south-east corner of Dufferin Street and Major Mackenzie Drive, is a structure of cultural heritage value to the City due to its architectural significance. Heritage Vaughan committee and Culture Services Staff recommend the Designation of the building under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act in an effort to preserve the building and ensure it can be incorporated in the proposed development on the property.

Attachments

1. Report on the Graham House outlining the Reasons for Designation of the building.
2. Location Map.

Report prepared by:

Diane LaPointe-Kay, Director of Recreation & Culture, ext. 8117
Angela Palermo, Manager of Cultural Services, ext. 8139

Respectfully submitted,

Marlon Kallideen
Commissioner of Community Services

Reasons for Designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act

Graham House
9933 Dufferin Street
Lot 20, Concession 2

Summary

The William Graham House located on the west half of Lot 20, Concession 2 is recommended for Designation under the Ontario Heritage Act for its cultural heritage value and interest.

The structure is believed to have been constructed in two phases: the original rectangular portion of the house facing Major Mackenzie Drive determined to have a construction date between 1860 and 1878 and a south addition to the structure estimated as having a circa 1920 construction date. In summary, the house is an excellent example of a combined Georgian style (north portion) and Classical Revival/Colonial Revival style design details (1920 additions). Overall the house is an exemplary study of good design form and significant to the architectural heritage of the community.

Historical Background

The original Crown Patent for the 200-acre parcel of land at Lot 20, Concession 2 was issued to Kings College in 1827. By 1860, William Graham had purchased the west half of Lot 20, however, had not built a home on the property. William Graham was a farmer and farmed the property with his wife Matilda and children John, Jacob, Mary Ann and Sarah. The 1878 Atlas of York County identifies that Jacob Graham retained ownership of the property from his father and by that time a house is identified as having been constructed on the property. By the early twentieth century, the Rumble family purchased the property and is believed to have added the south addition to the house.

Architectural Description

The Graham House was constructed in two distinct phases and time periods. The original portion of the house is located on the north end of the existing building. A middle portion and south rectangular addition is attached to the original portion of the house to create an "H" floor plan: two rectangular buildings that project out from a conjoining middle portion. The original portion (north wing) of the building was constructed between 1860 and 1878. This portion, as is the entire house, is constructed in red brick with decorative brick details such as corner quoining, radiating voussoirs and brick coursing. The entire exterior of the house was painted a white colour.

The original portion of the house is a Georgian style house with a symmetrical façade, having six-over-six pane sash windows on either side of the entranceway. The entranceway on this north (original) portion has a six pane transom and four pane sidelights surrounding the doorway representative of its Georgian style. A semi-circular dormer is found above the roofline at this north entranceway and also found above the main entranceway of the structure. The semi-circular dormers are likely an early 20th century addition, as this style of dormer is common for the period.

The southern portion of the house is estimated as having a circa 1920 date of construction due to the semi-circular dormers and Classical/Colonial Revival style design details, popular during this period. The entranceway centrally located, has a multi-pane pane transom and sidelights on either side. A portico with a bell-cast roof and decorative geometric posts shelters the doorway area.

On either side of the entranceway, the gable ends of the north and south rectangular wings, project out and on each side of the elevation are found four windows, two lower storey and two upper storey, six-

over-six sashed windows. The same treatment is found on the other side or east elevation of the building. Most windows have a six-over-six pane arrangement and have original shutters on them.

At either end of the house at the peak of the gable roof, double stacked chimneys balance and provide symmetry to the building's roofline. An early 20th century slate roof, a rare and costly roof material crowns the building. The house has returned eaves at its gable ends and moulded cornices below the roofline of the building

The interior of the building, at one time, containing original floorboards, baseboards, doors, staircase, fireplace mantels and decorative wood panelling has been removed from the house.

PHOTOGRAPHS OF GRAHAM HOUSE MAY 2005



North Elevation (original structure contracted between 1860-1875)



Façade, West Elevation of House



East Elevation, Back of House



South Elevation, Rear of House

ATTACHMENT 2

LOCATION OF 9933 DUFFERIN STREET, GRAHAM HOUSE

