## COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE (WORKING SESSION) JUNE 28, 2010

# CITY OF VAUGHAN PARKING STANDARDS REVIEW FILE 15.101 WARDS 1 TO 5

# Recommendation

The Commissioner of Planning in consultation with the Commissioners of the Legal Services, Engineering and Public Works, and Finance Departments, recommend:

- THAT the report, "Review of Parking Standards Contained within the City of Vaughan's Comprehensive Zoning By-law" (Attachment #1) and "City of Vaughan Parking Design Guidelines", dated March 2010 (Attachment #2), BE RECEIVED; and
- THAT staff be directed to prepare an amendment to Zoning By-law 1-88 based on the report "Review of Parking Standards Contained within the City of Vaughan's Comprehensive Zoning By-law", and that it be brought forward to a future Public Hearing of the Committee of the Whole; and
- 3. THAT a Working Group be established consisting of the Enforcement Services, Building Standards, Fire & Safety, Engineering, Planning, Finance, Legal Services Departments, and any other Departments necessary to address the issues of onstreet parking, priced parking and the management and enforcement of public parking, including consideration of the development of a Parking Strategy and Parking Management Business Plan.

## Contribution to Sustainability

The Review of Parking Standards Contained within the City of Vaughan Comprehensive Zoning By-law (Parking Study) adopts parking standards and requirements that are key land use management tools to promote more sustainable forms of development including:

- supporting more efficient forms of development in terms parking supply/demand management of land requirements;
- supporting the envisioned urban structure of public transit investments and Transit Oriented Development (TOD) policies;
- encouraging transportation alternatives to the automobile and single-occupant vehicle (SOV) use;
- mitigating the environmental impacts of parking facilities such as stormwater runoff and their contribution to the urban heat island effect;
- creating a more attractive and green parking environment through landscaping and other design considerations; and,
- minimizing parking spill-over into sensitive areas:

# **Economic Impact**

The economic impact of some of the outcomes of the Parking Study have yet to be determined and will depend on Council's decisions respecting the final recommendations of the study (e.g. cost of establishing a parking committee or authority).

#### **Communications Plan**

The consultation process to-date has included four half-day workshops with City and Regional staff from the following departments: Policy Planning, Development Planning, Enforcement Services, Economic Development, Office of City Manager, Building Standards, Engineering, Public Works, York Region Transit, and York Region Planning and Development Services Department, Town of Markham Planning, and VIVA Transit held on the following dates:

- February 27, 2008 Presentation to review existing standards, best practices and preliminary survey parking results.
- ii. June 27, 2008 Workshop to discuss the study findings and draft recommendations and opportunity for feedback.
- iii. October 2, 2008 Workshop to review report highlights and discuss comments and concerns resulting from the circulation of the study.
- iv. January 6, 2009 Workshop to continue discussion from the October session and give participants an opportunity to provide detailed feedback following the final draft report circulation.

In addition to these workshops, the consultant conducted interviews with various stakeholders including the Kleinburg Ratepayers Association, Maple Ratepayers Association, Woodbridge Core Ratepayers' Association, Developers, Smart Commute North Toronto, and the Vaughan Chamber of Commerce. Details of the interviews conducted by IBI Group are found in Appendix D, Attachment #1 of the Parking Study.

On January 18, 2010 the Policy Planning Department held a meeting with staff from the Development Planning, Building Standards, Engineering, Enforcement Services, and Fire and Rescue Departments to discuss some of the issues arising from the December 2009 circulation of Draft 2 of the Parking Study. This meeting focused on issues respecting the implementation of proposed "adjustment factors" (providing alternative minimum and maximum parking requirements tailored to local conditions such as the reduction in parking for sites in close proximity to public transit, as discussed in section 2 of this report), on-street / lay-by, priced and public parking and cash-in-lieu of parking initiatives. A follow-up meeting was held for further discussion on February 5, 2010.

Given the complexity of the aforementioned issues, it was agreed by the participating Departments that further specialized and detailed analysis is required to fully understand the implications of each issue, their impact on operations of various City Departments and their implementation if determined to be appropriate. Staff agreed that a "Working Group" for Parking in Vaughan should be established to address the outstanding issues of on-street parking, priced/public parking, city-wide cash-in-lieu of parking, and parking management. This Working Group should be led by Enforcement Services and consist of representatives from, Fire and Safety, Legal Services, Engineering (Development/Transportation Division), Development Planning, Policy Planning, Building Standards and Finance, and any other department or agency as appropriate.

#### **Purpose**

The purpose of this report is to:

1. Submit a final study for the "Review of Parking Standards Contained within the City of Vaughan's Comprehensive Zoning By-law" (Parking Study), and the "City of Vaughan"

Parking Design Guidelines", March 2010, for the consideration of the Committee of the Whole (Working Session).

- 2. Obtain direction from the Committee of the Whole to bring forward a By-law amendment to implement the recommendations of the *Review of Parking Standards Contained within the City of Vaughan Comprehensive Zoning By-law (Parking Study)* subsequent to Council's adoption of the new Official Plan.
- 3. Obtain direction from Council to establish a Working Group of the City Departments, led by Enforcement Services Department to further review specific recommendations of the Review of Parking Standards Contained within the City of Vaughan Comprehensive Zoning By-law (Parking Study) with respect to the implementation of priced and off-site parking, on-street, public parking, cash-in-lieu of parking and the management of parking.

#### **Background**

On March 9, 2009, a draft report was considered by the Committee of the Whole (Working Session) updating Council on the work to-date regarding the City's Parking Study, and to obtain direction for Staff to proceed with next steps (Refer to Attachment #4). The recommendations in the draft report were generally well received. Two issues were raised by the Committee regarding:

- policies related to on-street parking in existing residential areas; and,
- exploring ways to incorporate more trees and landscaping in major parking lots.

With respect to on-street parking in residential areas, the draft report recommended that this initiative be "at the City's discretion". Council was informed that further discussions and analysis with relevant City and Regional departments was required. Staff was directed to continue with the remainder of the Parking Study.

With respect to "greening" surface parking areas, Council was informed at the March 9, 2009 Committee of the Whole (Working Session) that additional supplemental studies regarding green urban design guidelines for surface, structured parking would be forthcoming as part of the study. Staff, together with IBI Group Inc., have developed a set of urban design guidelines for parking areas in Vaughan (Attachment #2) that meet the objective of the Terms of Reference (e.g. promote more sustainable forms of development). The Parking Design Guidelines emphasize site planning guidelines, pedestrian connectivity, safety, comfort, aesthetics and environmental sustainability, and as a component of this, more and better vegetation as part of the landscaping for surface parking lots.

On January 25, 2010, Official Plan Review Committee brought forward an item with respect to "Landscaping Standards on Commercial Properties". The concern focused on the requirement for planting in parking lots in the Official Plan. It was established that this issue would be resolved through the Zoning By-law and Parking Design Guidelines.

## 1. The Policy Planning Context

i. Provincial Policy Statement (PPS)

The Provincial Policy Statement (PPS) 2005, approved on March 1, 2005, provides direction to municipalities that land use decisions "shall be consistent with" the PPS. The recommendations in the Parking Study are generally consistent with the PPS. The PPS

encourages efficient and cost effective development, land use patterns and support for public transit as well as the protection of natural heritage features and areas.

In general, the policies in the PPS promote the planning and development of intensification, a mix of uses that minimize vehicular commuting, while promoting public transit. These policies encourage transportation and land use considerations at all stages throughout the planning process. Municipalities may further establish policies to support the policies and objectives in the PPS.

#### ii. Places To Grow: Provincial Growth Plan

The Province of Ontario released the Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe in 2006. The policies in the Growth Plan support intensification, compact development and redevelopment within existing built areas. Places to Grow also encourages transit-supportive development, establishment of bicycle parking in 'major transit station areas' (s. 2.2.5), minimization of surface parking in employment areas (s. 2.2.6), and Transportation Demand Management strategies (s.3.2.2.) that encourage more efficient use of transportation by influencing travel behaviour (i.e. parking management, bicycle facilities and programs).

# iii. Regional Official Plan Council Approved (December 2009)

The York Region Official Plan on December 16, 2009 The objectives in this document are based on sustainable development, from a triple bottom line perspective to obtain and maintain – sustainable natural environment, healthy communities, and economic vitality.

York Region considers effective parking management to be a major policy tool in achieving a 30 percent non-auto modal share in urban area by 2031, and 50 percent non-auto modal share in Regional Centres and Corridors by 2031 (S.7.2.26).

Sections 3.4 (Cultural Heritage), Section 5.2 (Sustainable Cities and Sustainable Communities), Section 5.4 (Regional Centres) – Implementation of policies that support parking management policies that encourage reduced minimum and maximum parking requirements, shared parking requirements, site design that prohibits the placement of surface parking between the main building entrance and major streets.

Policies in the Regional Council approved Draft Regional Official Plan require that each municipality establish an approach anticipating the transition of surface parking to structured/underground parking as the development of sites evolve and the establishment of a municipal parking authority, cash-in-lieu parking policies, preferential carpool parking, and the accommodation of bicycle parking and facilities.

# iv. Regional Official Plan (2004)

Key features in the currently "in effect" Region Official Plan (ROP) include policies that support compact development. With respect to Parking, the ROP includes policies that encourage pedestrian friendly, transit-oriented development and design and emphasizes the use of appropriate parking and design standards that include:

- a) Compact development and opportunities for structured / underground parking;
- b) Opportunities to encourage transit ridership through use of parking standards in Regional Centres that support maximum parking standards, establishment of parking authorities, and cash in-lieu programs;
- Opportunity to examine improvement of parking policies through secondary plans supportive of local businesses (i.e. on-street parking);

d) Development and redevelopment of Local Corridors require strategies that address site-specific parking requirements. These strategies must consider planned public transit service, residential and commercial needs, and alternatives to on-street parking along street frontage (with appropriate screening where necessary).

## v. City of Vaughan Draft Official Plan (2010)

The Draft Vaughan Official Plan seeks to implement policies supported in the Places to Grow, Provincial Policy Statement and draft approved Regional Official Plan with respect to Parking. Section 4.3.2. of the new Official Plan includes policies supportive of increased permissions for on-street parking, lower parking requirements and shared parking facilities to reduce parking lot sizes and create a high quality urban environment, reflecting Vaughan's status as a major growing, transit-supportive and pedestrian friendly city through:

- a) establishment of a municipal parking authority;
- b) reduction of parking requirements, where feasible:
- c) development of guidelines for cash-in-lieu of parking in Intensification Areas;
- d) development of central, shared parking facilities in Intensification Areas;
- e) permission of on-street parking on arterial roads where appropriate;
- f) accessible parking supply and design requirements under the Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act, as amended;
- g) requiring the development of parking structures, where appropriate;
- h) encouraging pedestrian friendly environments and accessibility through building orientation and good urban design.

# vi. Vaughan Zoning By-law 1-88

Current parking standards as set-out in Zoning By-law 1-88 were originally adopted in 1988 and amended from time to time. The policies in Zoning By-law 1-88 are a "one size fits all" approach and do not reflect the City's current urban fabric or planning vision.

#### 2. Synopsis of Draft Parking Standards Review Policy Approach

The recommended policies in the Parking Standards Review are summarized below.

The overall approach adopted in this study is that parking zoning standards should be responsible, implementable, and promote more sustainable forms of development. Multiple approaches for assessing and developing parking standards are used. Highlights identified in the report include:

- "Responsible" Parking Requirements balancing the need to require appropriate levels of parking without contributing to extensive oversupply and inefficient land use
- Reducing Number of Uses to simplify the standards and improve their accuracy, the
  proposed standards consolidate uses, where appropriate, particularly for retail, restaurant
  and industrial/employment uses.
- Sensitivity to Urban Context The proposed standards specify alternative minimum and maximum (in certain instances) parking requirements for four different urban categories, reflecting alternative transportation conditions and planning objectives for these areas

- Sensitivity to Parking Demand and Existing Supply adjustment factors are also specified to tailor parking requirements to local conditions (e.g. reduction of parking for sites within close proximity to public transit)
- Cash-in-lieu and Public Parking Cash-in-lieu is recommended as one strategy to help fund for the provision of parking spaces as well as improvements to public parking (e.g. signage, site access, pedestrian realm)
- Improved Parking Design recommendations are provided regarding parking space access and dimensions, and potential by-law requirements for design aspects such as landscaping, location, layout and stormwater management
- Bicycle Parking bicycle parking requirements are specified for office, retail, restaurant, multi-unit residential and school and other institutional uses for both interim and long-term spaces
- Accessible Parking it is anticipated that Vaughan will conform to the Province's Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act, as amended, therefore recommendations are not proposed at this time

## 3. Parking Study Highlights and Proposed Recommendations

Below are some of the main highlights and proposed recommendations within the Parking Standards Review study:

# i. Standards Based on Urban Context

The parking standards in Zoning By-law 1-88 are generic and do not have regard for the geographic context of a site. As the City intensifies, and transit service evolves, a "one size fits all" approach with respect to providing the appropriate amount of parking will not be efficient in all locations and for all uses within the City. The Parking Study recommends minimum and maximum parking standards be applied based on a property's location and land use. The draft new Official Plan, establishes an Urban Structure consisting of Intensification Areas (e.g. Vaughan Metropolitan Centre, Primary Centres, Local Centres and Primary Intensification Corridors) and in stable areas (e.g. Community Areas and Employment Areas) which considers transportation and proposed densities. These different contexts provide the basis for varied parking standards. For example, it is recommended that maximum parking standards may be exceeded only if parking is situated underground in intensification areas. Detailed discussion of the proposed parking geography and categories are discussed in Section 3 (i) of this report.

It should be noted, in order for locational criteria to apply, detailed zoning maps need to be created that show the parcel fabric to which the higher-order transit hub designation applies.

## ii. Reduction of Parking Requirements

The required parking spaces in By-law 1-88 are higher than many municipalities in the GTA. The Parking Study proposes parking reductions for each land use in the City. More intense reductions are proposed in major Centres, Corridors and Intensification Areas in Vaughan. (Refer to Attachment 3 for a summary of proposed parking standards of this report). The reduced parking standards are intended to balance the need to require appropriate levels of parking without contributing to oversupply and inefficient use of land.

#### iii. Bicycle Parking

Bicycle parking is proposed for office, retail, restaurant, multi-unit residential and school uses. Bicycle parking standards are further determined by Class 1 (Long-term) and Class 2 (Short-term) parking availability. The intent of this standard is to ensure that alternative sustainable modes of travel are accommodated. The proposed bicycle standards are as follows:

## **Proposed Bicycle Parking Standards**

Use Category	High-Order Trar Centres, Primary Intensification	Centres/Primary	Base/Other Areas		
	Class 1*	Class 2**	Class 1*	Class 2**	
Office	0.13 spaces/100m²	Greater of: 0.1/100 m² or 6 spaces	0.08 spaces/100 m²	Greater of: 0.05/100 m² or 6 spaces	
Retail/Restaurant	0.1 spaces/100 m <sup>2</sup>	Greater of: 0.15/100 m² or 6 spaces	0.05 spaces/100 m²	Greater of: 0.1/100 m² or 6 spaces	
Medical Office	0.1 spaces/100 m <sup>2</sup>	Greater of: 0.1/100 m² or 6 spaces	0.05 spaces/100 m²	Greater of: 0.05/100 m² or 6 spaces	
Multi-Unit Residential	0.5 spaces/unit for buildings with >10 units	Greater of: 0.2 spaces/unit or 6 spaces	0.5 spaces /unit for buildings with > 10 units	Greater of 0.1 spaces/unit or 6 spaces	
Schools	0.05/100 m²	0.4/100 m²	0.05/100m m <sup>2</sup>	0.4/100 m <sup>2</sup>	

# NOTES:

The Parking Study recommends parking standards for Office, Retail/Restaurant, Medical Office, Multi-Unit Residential, and School Land uses. The Parking Study does not discuss bicycle parking requirements for other uses such as employment and institutional uses, and park areas. Therefore, it is recommended that an Employment use category be added to the proposed Bicycle Standards and that the standard consist of "Class 2" "Office" (0.1/100 m², or 6 spaces) for the office component of the Employment building and 1 space per 3,050 m of floor area of "Class 1" for the industrial component. The City of Vancouver Bicycle Parking Standards and Guidelines has been used as guidance and is as follows:

The City of Vancouver has addressed bicycle standards for employment uses, as requiring: 1 space per 3,050 m<sup>2</sup> of floor area (100% long-term bicycle storage facilities) For Industrial (light, general, heavy).

It is also recommended that an Institutional use category be added to the proposed Bicycle Standards and the standard recognizes the component parts of the use such as office, school, place of assembly, etc. For example, uses such as Place of Worship. It is

<sup>\*</sup> Class 1: Long term parking that is provided in a locked separate bicycle room located within a building or automobile parking facility – lockers, bicycle rooms, and bicycle cages.

<sup>\*\*</sup>Class 2: Short term parking provided in racks that are designed to lock the frame and a wheel to the rack using a conventional U-lock.

recommended that further detailed analyses for bicycle parking for Institutional uses be completed for the final report.

#### iv. Off-site Parking

The Parking Study recommends that off-site parking (i.e. dedicated private/public parking areas) should be considered for proposed intensification areas, particularly in High Order Transit Hubs, Local Centres and Intensification Corridors within Vaughan shown as Attachment #4.

Implementation of the provision requires further discussion and analysis with the City's Legal Services Department and the establishment of a "Working Group" as set-out in the Recommendation and Communication Sections of this report.

#### v. Adjustment Factors

On April 19, 2010 the City of Vaughan released the draft new Official Plan. A major policy direction in the Official Plan is accommodating intensification to respond to Provincial and Regional policy along major corridors and centres. As Vaughan is in the beginning stages of the intensification process, Adjustment Factor Guidelines have been included as part of the Parking Standards Review study to provide additional flexibility for the application and implementation of the proposed parking standards within Vaughan.

Adjustment factors can be applied to reduce minimum and maximum parking requirements, based on the site-specific land use context, and the land use designation which would influence parking demand. Site specific adjustment factors include:

- transit accessibility;
- availability of off-site parking and on-street parking;
- · walkability/pedestrian friendly environment;
- availability of car share vehicles and carpool parking;
- mixed land uses opportunities for shared parking between uses;
- opportunities for the purchase and/or lease of parking space ("unbundled parking"), and;
- availability of shuttle services.

The study recommends that the application of adjustment factors in conjunction with the proposed parking standards is beneficial in that it provides sensitivity to the locational context of a site without having to develop unique parking standards for site-specific developments which would require amendments to the zoning by-law. The proposed adjustment factors are generally consistent throughout the City, however there are outstanding issues requiring further discussion and analysis in order for them to be implemented. For example, further discussion and analysis is required with respect to the establishment of off-site and on-street parking due to issues such as the road right-of-way width and shared parking agreements.

#### vi. Parking Space Dimensions

The Parking Study recommends the reduction of parking stall dimensions for small car spaces to promote the use of smaller, more fuel-efficient vehicles and to promote more efficient use of land for parking. Small car spaces and bicycle parking are recommended to be located in preferential locations in parking areas (notwithstanding the required preferential location and parking stall size for accessible parking stalls).

## **Recommended Parking Space Dimensions**

	Existing by-law			Proposed Standard		
	Length	Width	Aisle	Length	Width	Aisle (see Aisles section above)
Perpendicular Spaces (residential)	6m	2.7m	4- 6m	5.7m	2.7m**	6m*
Perpendicular Spaces (all other)	6m	2.7m	4- 6m	5.7m	2.7m**	6m*
Parallel Spaces/lay-by parking	6m	2.7m	4- 6m	6.7m	2.6m	3.5m
Small Car Spaces (perpendicular only)	-	-	-	4.6m	2.3m	same as standard
Bicycle (horizontal)	-	-	-	1.8m	0.6m	0.9m
Bicycle (vertical)	-	-	_	1.8m	0.3m	0.9m

<sup>\*</sup> Reduced aisle widths may be permitted where parking spaces are angled and the drive aisle is one direction only, consistent with the existing by-law.

The consultant recommends, the size of a parking stall be reduced by 30 cm (12 inches) in length, and 10 cm (4 inches) in width for both residential and non-residential perpendicular spaces. However, based on staff feedback and recent experience in Toronto, it is recommended that the width of a perpendicular stall remains at 2.7 m in width. When the City of Toronto undertook their parking standard review, it was concluded that a stall width of 2.7 m was appropriate provided that the aisle width was 6.0 m or greater. After consultation with the development industry, the City reduced the width to 2.6 m.

Therefore, staff recommends maintaining the current stall width of 2.7 metres and reducing the stall length to 5.7m. The overall size of stall would be reduced, thus addressing greater efficiency and environmental sustainability.

The Parking Study also recommends that where a parking space that is located adjacent to walls or other obstructions, the recommended parking space dimensions should be increased by 0.3 m where two sides of the space abut walls. This will address many of the concerns experienced in townhouse garages which are not useable because people have difficulty in opening the vehicle doors sufficient to permit manageable egress.

The Parking Study does not propose any changes to the accessible parking standards in By-law 1-88 at this time. It is expected that the City will conform to the required accessible parking space dimensions based on the Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act that are currently being developed by the Province.

<sup>\*\*</sup> City recommended parking space widths.

#### vii. Public Parking

With the extension of the subway into Vaughan, the development of a new downtown and development intensification in the City, the Study recommends that there is a need for Vaughan to take a greater role in parking management. The Parking Study recommends the development of public parking, a municipal parking authority or 'parking management division' and that a cash-in-lieu/priced parking program be developed with further discussion and analysis. It is also recommended that the collected funds may not only contribute to construction and operation of public parking, but also on measures to improve parking efficiency (e.g. improved signage and technology) and reduction in parking demand in the area (e.g. pedestrian and cycling improvements). The establishment of parking management policies is consistent with the policies of the York Region Official Plan (2009).

It is suggested that these issues be addressed through further detailed discussion and analysis with the Working Group as recommended by the Policy Planning Department.

## viii. Commuter Parking

With the proposed expansion of subway lines, GO Service, and VIVA Transit service, the Parking Study recommends that the following considerations be included in the future zoning by-law to address commuter parking:

- Commuter parking lots shall contain 1 secure bicycle parking space for every 10 peak period transit riders (as estimated using travel demand models), but no less than 15 spaces;
- 5% of parking spaces will be designated to registered carpool vehicles in commuter parking lots with enforcement of these spaces overseen by the transit authority (when established, as encouraged by the policies in the York Region and City Official Plan).

## ix. Parking Design

Parking Design Guidelines (Attachment #2) have been developed to implement the policy objectives and regulations produced by the Parking Study with the emphasis on pedestrian, safety and comfort, aesthetics and environmental sustainability. The design guidelines are consistent with the principles outlined in the Parking Study and address issues such as location and layout of parking spaces, pedestrian access and circulation, barrier-free access, landscaping, bicycle circulation and parking, vehicular parking, access and circulation, site servicing and underground access as well as stormwater management, lighting and structured parking.

The primary objectives of parking design guidelines include:

- improving public realm safety, comfort, connectivity and aesthetics;
- integrating, parking areas within the existing and planned urban context;
- creating/enhancing/maintaining green spaces;
- mitigating the urban heat island effect;
- · managing stormwater run-off.

## 3. Description of the Proposed Revisions to the Parking Standards Review Report:

Since the consideration of the Parking Study by the Committee of the Whole (Working Session) on March 9, 2009, changes to the study have been undertaken to reflect the comments outlined through the study process. In addition to those changes summarized previously in this report, are the following:

# i. Modification of Urban Structure Mapping and Nomenclature

In light of the City's Official Plan Review, proposed nomenclatures (categories) in the revised Parking Study have been updated to reflect the identity and location of the City's urban structure categories in the new Official Plan.

# Proposed Approach to Parking Standards By Urban Structure Category

Urban Context Category	Approach
High-Order Transit  Applies to:	Lowest parking minimums recognizing high level of transit service and planned availability of on- and off-street collective parking.
Vaughan Metropolitan Centre Steeles Ave. West, Yonge Street	Responsible parking maximums designed to encourage transit use, promote compact development, and support establishment of on and off-street collective, priced parking.
	<b>High potential for public parking</b> including on- and off-street facilities provided that parking maximums are enforced and City develops capacity to provide public parking.
Local Centres	Low parking minimums recognizing small lots, mixed-use development form, desire to maintain high-quality public realm, and availability of on-street parking.
Applies to: Woodbridge, Thornhill, Maple, Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation Districts, Vellore, Carrville, Concord	Parking maximums on surface parking designed to discourage large surface parking lots, encourage transit use and structured parking, and support development of more on- and off-street collective parking.
,	High potential for public parking in selected areas including on-street (in commercial/industrial areas) and off-street facilities provided that parking maximums are enforced and City develops capacity to provide public parking.
Primary Centres/Primary Intensification Corridor	Reduced parking minimums recognizing good level of transit service and desire for compact development.
Applies to: Regional Corridors: Yonge Street, Avenue 7, Jane Street Vaughan Metropolitan Centre West	Parking maximums on surface parking designed to encourage transit use, discourage large surface parking lots and support establishment of on- and off-street collective, priced parking.
	Medium potential for public parking in selected areas including on- and off- street facilities building.
Base (Other Areas)	Basic parking minimums requiring a minimum responsible level of parking, but allowing for some flexibility to account for availability of travel choices and
Applies to: The rest of the City including	surrounding land use context.
Employment Areas and Community Areas	No maximum parking limits recognizing that these areas are currently auto dependent and not well served by transit.

#### ii. City of Vaughan Parking Design Guidelines

Details and recommendations of the proposed Parking Design Guidelines are discussed in Section 2 (v) of this report and the Design Guidelines are included as Attachment 2 of this report.

## iii. Recommendations from Building Standards Department

The Building Standards Department has reviewed the draft study and provided the following comments. The final study and implementing zoning by-law will reflect the comments provided.

- a) In the event that a non employment use exceeds that which is permitted in the current zoning by-Law, then parking for the use be calculated on the basis of those uses and that this is taken care of by reference note on Page 13 (Note 3) of the Parking Standards Review.
- b) Consideration must be given to pick up and drop off activity associated with schools at the site plan application stage.
- c) Recommends that there should be no reduction for medical uses in any area of Vaughan.
- d) Recommends that the parking standards for restaurants are too low, and may need to be increased. Concerns with respect to parking standards for restaurant uses will be revisited in the final draft.
- e) It should be noted, that enforcement needs will likely increase and the review of applications may take more time.
- f) In the final review consideration will be given to defining "small car" for enforcement purposes.

The issues outlined above will be revisited and reflected in the revised Zoning By-law, where appropriate and addressed in the Public Hearing report.

## Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

The City-wide Parking Standards Review Study and Guidelines are consistent with Vaughan Vision 2020 Strategic Plan, through the following initiatives, specifically:

## Service Excellence:

Lead and Promote Environmental Sustainability

#### Management Excellence:

- Enhance productivity, cost effectiveness & innovation
- · Plan and Manage Growth and Economic Vitality
- Demonstrate Leadership & Promote Effective Governance

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council.

# Conclusion

The Parking Standards Review Study and Parking Design Guidelines have been developed through extensive collaboration with City and Regional staff, external agencies. The revised Parking Study includes modifications to address concerns expressed at the previous Committee of the Whole (Working Session) in March 2009.

This report describes key components of the revised Parking Study, including modifications introduced since the initial draft of the document. Should the Committee of the Whole concur, the revised "Parking Standards Review Report (March 2010)", including the attached "City of Vaughan Parking Design Guidelines" should be received and staff be directed to schedule a Public Hearing and prepare a Zoning By-law for consideration to implement the findings of the Parking Study.

As a follow-up to the parking issues raised during the study, it is recommended that a Working Group be established, led by the Enforcement Services Department and consisting of the necessary City Departments to undertake the analysis required to address outstanding concerns regarding the feasibility of on-street/off-site parking in Vaughan, cash-in-lieu, paid and permit parking systems. Further analysis and discussion is also required to address parking management/governance, a Parking Management Business Plan and Implementation Strategy for the potential establishment of a Parking Authority in Vaughan. The leading departments on these initiatives will be determined through discussions with the Working Group.

## **Attachments**

- 1. Draft Review of Parking Standards Contained within the City of Vaughan's Comprehensive By-law: Final Report March 2010 (Mayor and Members of Council ONLY).
- 2. Draft "Design Guidelines for Parking in Vaughan" (Mayor and Members of Council ONLY).
- 3. Summary of Proposed Parking Standards (Mayor and Members of Council ONLY).
- 4. March 9, 2009 Committee of the Whole (Working Session) Staff Report for City of Vaughan Parking Standards Review

## Report prepared by:

Melissa Rossi, Policy Planner 1, ext: 8320

Respectfully submitted,

John Zipay Commissioner of Planning Diana Birchall
Director of Policy Planning

# **EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF MARCH 23, 2009**

Item 1, Report No. 15, of the Committee of the Whole (Working Session), which was adopted without amendment by the Council of the City of Vaughan on March 23, 2009.

## CITY OF VAUGHAN PARKING STANDARDS REVIEW REPORT FILE 15.101

The Committee of the Whole (Working Session) recommends:

- 1) That Clauses 1 and 2 of the recommendation contained in the following report of the Commissioner of Planning, dated March 9, 2009, be approved;
- 2) That the Policy Planning staff and IBI Group proceed to complete the report based on this Working Session and Council's comments with respect to the next steps to establish an updated parking standards policy for the City of Vaughan; and
- 3) That the presentation by Mr. Brian Hollingworth, IBI Group, and presentation material submitted entitled, "Review of Parking Standards Contained within the City of Vaughan's Comprehensive Zoning By-law", dated March 9, 2009, be received.

## Recommendation

1

The Commissioner of Planning recommends:

- That the presentation by IBI Group Inc., and material submitted dated February 2, 2009 be RECEIVED:
- 2. That the Draft report, "Review of Parking Standards Contained Within the City of Vaughan's Comprehensive Zoning By-law", January 2009, be RECEIVED; and,
- That Policy Planning staff and IBI Group proceed to complete the report based on this
  working session and Council's further direction with respect to the next steps to establish
  an updated parking standards policy for the City of Vaughan.

## **Economic Impact**

The economic impact of the outcomes of this study are yet to be determined and will depend on decisions the City may make on final recommendations (e.g. cost of establishing a parking committee or authority).

#### Communications Plan

The consultation process to-date has included four half-day staff workshops with City and Regional staff members from the following departments: Policy Planning, Development Planning, Enforcement Services, Economic Development, Corporate Policy, Building Standards, Engineering, Public Works, York Region Transit, and York Region Planning and Development Services Department, Town of Markham Planning, and VIVA Transit).

Four half-day workshops were held with staff as follows:

February 27, 2008 – Presentation to review existing standards, best practices and preliminary survey parking results.

June 27, 2008 – Workshop with staff discussing study findings and draft recommendations and opportunity for feedback from staff.

## **EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF MARCH 23, 2009**

#### item 1, CW(WS) Report No. 15 - Page 3

On November 10, 2008 (Report No, 53, Item 35), Committee of the Whole directed planning staff to bring forward a report to future Committee of the Whole meeting, to "deal with the issue of drive-throughs". Policy staff are currently looking into undertaking the analysis and development of policies for drive-through uses.

#### Analysis

The "Parking Requirements" contained within By-law 1-88 demonstrate an auto-oriented approach which ensures that each destination can accommodate peak parking demand on site, thereby minimizing the potential for off-site impacts. The existing requirements do not give consideration to the availability of alternative forms of transportation, urban context, or development forms. Large tracts of dispersed development patterns in Vaughan, strengthen automobile dependence and discourage alternative forms of transportation, such as cycling and walking. Many of the recommendations in the draft final report offer alternative and sustainable forms of addressing the issue of parking in Vaughan.

The overall approach adopted in this study is that parking zoning standards should be responsible, implementable, and promote more sustainable forms of development. Multiple approaches for assessing and developing parking standards are used. Highlights identified in the report include:

- "Responsible" Parking Requirements balancing the need to require appropriate levels of parking without contributing to extensive oversupply and inefficient land use
- Reducing Number of Uses to simplify the standards and improve their accuracy, the proposed standards consolidate uses, where appropriate, particularly for retail, restaurant and industrial/employment uses
- Sensitivity to Urban Context The proposed standards specify alternative minimum and maximum (in certain instances) parking requirements for four different urban categories, reflecting alternative transportation conditions and planning objectives for these areas
- Sensitivity to Parking Demand and Existing Supply adjustment factors are also specified to tailor parking requirements to local conditions (e.g. reduction of parking for sites within close proximity to public transit)
- Cash-in-lieu and Public Parking Cash-in-lieu is recommended as one strategy to help fund for the provision of parking spaces as well as improvements to public parking (e.g. signage, site access, pedestrian realm)
- Improved Parking Design recommendations are provided regarding parking space access and dimensions, and potential by-law requirements for design aspects such as landscaping, location, layout and stormwater management
- Bicycle Parking bicycle parking requirements are specified for office, retail, restaurant, multi-unit residential and school and other institutional uses for both interim and long-term spaces
- Accessible Parking it is anticipated that Vaughan will conform to the Province's Accessible Built Environment Standards, currently being developed as part of the Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act, therefore recommendations are not proposed at this time

# **EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF MARCH 23, 2009**

#### Item 1, CW(WS) Report No. 15 - Page 5

If Vaughan opts to increase its role in parking management and the provision of public parking, it will need an appropriate organizational structure to guide and implement these activities. Five parking management types are considered in the report. However, the recommended option is the creation of a Parking Advisory Committee and creation of a Parking Manager position to provide and coordinate staff support for this committee from various City Departments. This is the approach that the Town of Markham has taken.

- c) <u>Shared Parking</u> Shared parking using shared parking rates is recommended for individual uses on a particular site. If there is change in use on the site, shared parking calculations should be recalculated and additional parking will only be required if the minimum requirement increases by more than 10% (exceptions are places of worship and banquet halls due to the generation of parking demand outside of expected peaks).
- d) Off-site Parking Off-site parking agreements must at least be registered on title of the donor site as a restrictive covenant and easement. The registration of an easement on title will solidify the agreement, and the City will not need to police/enforce the agreement, rather the receiving and donor landowners will be obliged to resolve issues themselves.
- e) <u>On-Street Parking</u> The recommended approach is to: provide reductions in on-site requirements for lay-by parking provided on-street; consult with the Region to have them modify their lay-by policy to allow this parking to be used towards on-site requirements; and, create a policy that on-street parking can be substituted for off-street parking requirements where appropriate and secure into the future.
- f) <u>Transit</u> York Region Transit (YRT) would like the support from the City to create park and ride spaces. Park and ride activity is already occurring informally at a number of private lots. YRT would like to formalize these agreements. This option would require a policy to be formulated rather than a provision in the zoning by-law. Transit adjustment factors may need to be specified as a policy, since transit routes are often changing.
- g) <u>Historic Places</u> The areas designated as "Historic Places" (Woodbridge Core, Thornhill Heritage Conservation District, Maple Heritage Conservation District, Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage District) in the draft study report, are proposed as having a relatively low minimum and maximum requirement which applies to surface parking. This would discourage large surface parking developments in areas within this designation. It was discussed in staff workshop #4 (January 6, 2009), that a maximum of 4.5 spaces /100m2 for retail uses (as recommended in the report) would be too high and might allow too much surface parking. The minimum standard proposed for retail uses is 3 spaces /100m2 (refer to Exhibit ES-3 in Attachment 1). Alternatively, staff suggested in Workshop #4 that the parking standards should only specify minimum standards and require any spaces above the minimum to be provided in structured or underground parking areas.
- h) <u>Woodbridge Core</u> Council directed that Staff conduct a specific review of opportunities and options to guarantee a specific number of parking spaces available for use by the public within the Woodbridge Core. Empirical studies conducted by IBI Group shows that there is significant parking availability at peak times. Only 60% of the customer and publically accessible parking supply is occupied over the surveyed area within the Woodbridge Core. The study concludes that the majority of the lots that are underutilized are those that are less convenient and less visible. The report recommends:
  - 1. Improved signage much of the parking supply in the Woodbridge Core is behind buildings and not directly visible. Collaboration between the City, existing businesses and, developers in the Woodbridge Core is recommended to develop more consistent and clear approach to parking signage.

## **EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF MARCH 23, 2009**

## Item 1, CW(WS) Report No. 15 - Page 7

- YRT would like support from the City in creating park and ride spaces. YRT would like to formalize these agreements in the form of a policy as opposed to Zoning By-law amendment.
- The option for on-street parking may require Vaughan staff to consult with the Region to have modifications made to the lay-by policy to permit parking to be used towards on-site requirements.
- Should the City consider the option to establish a Parking Committee or Authority as discussed in the draft final report. The City may consider coordinating efforts with the Region (as recommended in York Region Transportation Masterplan).

#### Conclusion

As the City continues to evolve into an increasingly urban environment with more wide-spread and frequent public transportation, the City has recognized the need to review its parking standards. The draft Parking Standards Review Report proposes new parking standards for the City of Vaughan regulating the supply and design of private, off-street parking. It also discusses options and provides recommendations regarding the development of public parking. Should Council concur with the recommendations, staff will proceed with the next steps to obtain further feedback on the options respecting the update to the City's By-law 1-88.

#### **Attachments**

1. Draft Review of Parking Standards Contained within the City of Vaughan's Comprehensive By-law: Final Report (MAYOR AND MEMBERS OF COUNCIL only)

## Report prepared by:

Melissa Rossi, Policy Planner 1, ext: 8320 Wayne L. McEachern, Manager of Policy Planning, ext: 8026

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)