



CITY OF VAUGHAN  
SPECIAL COUNCIL MINUTES (2)  
OCTOBER 1, 2001

Table of Contents

<u>Minute No.</u>		<u>Page No.</u>
239.	CONFIRMATION OF AGENDA .....	225
240.	DISCLOSURE OF INTEREST .....	225
241.	SPADINA - YORK SUBWAY EXTENSION COMMITTEE PRESENTATION OF BUSINESS CASE – PRICEWATERHOUSECOOPERS RESOLUTION REQUESTING FEDERAL AND PROVINCIAL FUNDING FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT UPDATE ON THE STATUS OF THE SPADINA SUBWAY EXTENSION (Report No. 61, Item 1) .....	225
242.	CONFIRMING BY-LAW .....	231
243.	ADJOURNMENT .....	232



**CITY OF VAUGHAN**

**SPECIAL COUNCIL MEETING (2)**

**MONDAY, OCTOBER 1, 2001**

**MINUTES**

**6:11 P.M.**

Regional Councillor Di Biase, Acting Mayor, declared that a Special Council meeting would be convened in the Municipal Council Chambers in Vaughan, Ontario at 6:11 p.m. for which notice had not been given for the purpose of adopting the recommendation from the Committee of the Whole, Report No. 61, Item 1, of October 1, 2001.

The following members were present:

Regional Councillor M. Di Biase, Chair  
Regional Councillor J. Frustaglio  
Councillor B. Di Vona  
Councillor M. Ferri  
Councillor S. Kadis  
Councillor M. G. Racco

MOVED by Regional Councillor Frustaglio  
seconded by Councillor Racco

THAT the rules of the Procedure By-law with respect to Notice of a Special Council meeting be waived.

CARRIED

**239. CONFIRMATION OF AGENDA**

MOVED by Councillor Racco  
seconded by Councillor Kadis

THAT the agenda be confirmed.

CARRIED

**240. DISCLOSURE OF INTEREST**

There was no disclosure of interest by any member.

**241. SPADINA - YORK SUBWAY EXTENSION COMMITTEE  
PRESENTATION OF BUSINESS CASE – PRICEWATERHOUSECOOPERS  
RESOLUTION REQUESTING FEDERAL AND PROVINCIAL FUNDING FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT  
UPDATE ON THE STATUS OF THE SPADINA SUBWAY EXTENSION  
(Report No. 61, Item 1)**

MOVED by Councillor Racco  
seconded by Regional Councillor Frustaglio

## **SPECIAL COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES (2) – OCTOBER 1 2001**

---

That the following recommendation of the Committee of the Whole, Report No. 61, Item 1, of October 1, 2001, be approved:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Spadina – York Subway Extension Committee, dated October 1, 2001, be approved subject to replacing Clause 4, in accordance with the memorandum from the City Manager, dated September 28, 2001, as follows:
  - “4. The resolution forming Attachment No. 2, along with the resolution attached to the City Manager’s memorandum of September 28, 2001, BE APPROVED and that the resolutions be forwarded to:
    - a) All municipalities in the Greater Toronto Area, for their endorsement;
    - b) The appropriate Ministries and Agencies of the Provincial and Federal Governments; and
    - c) The local members of the Provincial Legislature and Parliament of Canada.”;
- 2) That this matter be forwarded to a Special Council Meeting (2) of October 1, 2001;
- 3) That the deputation of Mr. John Cartwright, Business Manager, Construction Trades Council, 15 Gervais Drive, Ste. 801, Don Mills, M3C 1Y8, be received; and
- 4) That the “Proposed Next Steps for Realizing Spadina-York Subway Extension”, submitted by PricewaterhouseCoopers, be received.

CARRIED

### **Recommendation**

The Spadina -York Subway Extension Committee recommends that:

1. This report BE RECEIVED:
2. The presentation by PricewaterhouseCoopers, in respect of the document entitled “Spadina - York Subway Extension - Business Case: A Solution for Gridlock in the Northwestern GTA”, dated June 22, 2001” BE RECEIVED;
3. The “Spadina - York Subway Extension - Business Case: A Solution for Gridlock in the Northwestern GTA” BE ENDORSED as the City’s position on the attributes and benefits of extending the Spadina Subway from the Downsview Station to the Vaughan Corporate Centre;
4. The draft resolution forming Attachment No. 2 to this report, requesting Provincial and Federal funding for transit in the Greater Toronto Area, BE APPROVED and that the resolution be forwarded to:
  - a) All municipalities in the Greater Toronto Area, for their endorsement;
  - b) The appropriate Ministries and Agencies of the Provincial and Federal Governments; and
  - c) The local members of the Provincial Legislature and Parliament of Canada.

### **Purpose**

This report has three main purposes:

1. To obtain Council endorsement of the document entitled “Spadina - York Subway Extension - Business Case: A solution for Gridlock in the Northwestern GTA” (Executive Summary Forming Attachment No. 1);
2. To obtain Council approval of a resolution requesting Provincial and Federal funding for public transit in the Greater Toronto Area and direction to send the resolution to the municipalities of the Greater Toronto Area for endorsement;
3. To provide an update on related matters.

**Background - Analysis and Options**

1. The “Spadina - York Subway Extension - Business Case: A solution for Gridlock in the Northwestern GTA”: Background to the Request for Council Endorsement and the Presentation by PricewaterhouseCoopers

Vaughan Council has taken a lead role in supporting improvements to public transit as a means of achieving the land use objectives of both the City’s Official Plan and the Region of York’s Official Plan. A critical element in the City’s land use plan is the Vaughan Corporate Centre, which is planned to be the City’s new downtown. It is also one of four “Regional Centres” in the Region of York Official Plan. Given the role of the Corporate Centre, the provision of public transit, particularly a transit connection to the Spadina Subway, has been identified as being critical to its success.

In December of 1998, Council initiated a study, which led to the preparation of the reports entitled “Higher Order Transit Corridor Protection Study - Vaughan Corporate Centre to York University” and “Property Protection for Steeles Rapid Transit Terminal Facilities - Rapid Transit Extension to York University”. These studies formed the basis of Official Plan Amendment No. 529, which identified and protected a transit right of way leading from York University to Highway 7 within the Corporate Centre and an inter-regional bus terminal site and a commuter parking lot on the north side of Steeles Avenue. OPA No. 529 was adopted by Council on July 10, 2000 and approved by the Ontario Municipal Board on March 1, 2001. In this vein, Council by resolution dated December 18, 2000, requested that the Region of York, purchase the bus terminal site.

If the traffic problems in the Greater Toronto Area are to be solved, public transit will have to link municipalities and provide continuous, convenient service. This will entail a high degree of cross-boundary co-operation between municipalities. In this spirit, Council, on May 8, 2000 approved the formation of the Spadina-York Subway Extension Committee. The purpose of the Committee was to commence formal discussions at the political level on the Spadina Subway Extension with the affected municipalities.

The current members of the Spadina -York Subway Extension Committee are Mayor Lorna Jackson and Councillor Mario G. Racco (Chair) from the City of Vaughan; Region of York Councillors Michael Di Biase and Joyce Frustaglio and Regional Chair Bill Fisch; Councillors Peter LiPreti, Maria Augimeri and David Miller (Alternate) from the City of Toronto; and Professor Edward S. Spence, Senior Policy Advisor from York University.

The Committee has been working to identify and promote the merits of the Spadina Subway Extension. It was noted that there were numerous studies and information sources that supported the concept of the subway extension. However, there was no comprehensive document that consolidated the argument under one cover. The Committee was of the opinion that the preparation of a “Business Case” was the best way to heighten awareness of the merits of the project. The Business Case would form the basis for the Committee to promote the Spadina Subway extension with the public, the technical agencies and the political decision makers.

On March 12, 2001, Council approved a recommendation from the Chair of the Spadina-York Subway Extension Committee that the firm PricewaterhouseCoopers be retained, on behalf of the Committee, to prepare the Business Case. Council also approved the budget required to complete the study.

On June 15, 2001 PricewaterhouseCoopers presented the Business Case to a meeting of the Spadina-York Subway Extension Committee. Following input and suggestions from Committee members, the report was finalized and copies were presented to Vaughan Council at its June 25, 2001 meeting. Council was also advised that the Committee would be submitting the Business Case to the Councils of the Region of York and the City of Toronto and to the administration of York University. It is expected that City of Toronto Staff will be reporting on the Business Case to the Planning and Transportation Committee in November.

While Council has been provided with copies of the document, it has not had the opportunity to formally endorse it, notwithstanding the high level support it has already demonstrated. It is the Committee's intention to continue with a promotional strategy based on the Business Case. Having Council endorse the Business Case will be of assistance as it will add further credibility to the Committee's work, especially when meeting with other government organizations, be they municipal, provincial or federal. To assist Committee of the Whole, PricewaterhouseCoopers has been requested to present the Business Case at this meeting.

2. Draft Resolution in Support of Funding for Transit By Senior Levels of Government

On September 7, 2001 the Spadina - York Subway Extension Committee approved a motion to send a resolution to Vaughan Council for its approval, requesting that senior levels of government provide funding for public transit in the Greater Toronto Area. Upon Council's approval, the resolution would be sent to the other municipalities in the Greater Toronto Area to be endorsed. The resolution would then be forwarded to the Provincial and Federal Governments for their consideration and action.

The fundamental need for senior government partners in the funding of transit is set out in the resolution's recital. The main points include:

- Public transit is required to ensure the economic, social and environmental health of our urban areas;
- Public transit supports a number of Provincial and Federal Policy Initiatives;
- The revenue provided by the property tax base is insufficient to meet the present and future transportation needs of the GTA;
- It is practice, both nationally and internationally, that public transit systems receive funding from senior levels of government, often as the share of a defined source, such as a gas tax;
- It is estimated that an additional \$800 million per year of transportation funding, will need to be provided each year over the next ten years to reduce the GTA's current level of road network congestion;
- The Provincial and Federal Gasoline Taxes take in approximately \$1.7 billion annually from the GTA;
- The dedication of 50% of these taxes would address the long term transportation needs of the GTA; and
- Funding priority should be given to sustaining, upgrading and expanding the public transit networks that serve the GTA.

On this basis, the resolution states:

**NOW THEREFORE IT IS HEREBY RESOLVED:**

**THAT** the Province of Ontario and the Federal Government are hereby requested to:

1. Provide financial support to the public transit systems in the Greater Toronto Area, including the provision of capital funding for the renewal of the existing systems and for further and substantial system expansions;
2. Provide such funding on the basis of a long term commitment that will allow for comprehensive and rational system planning, together with the timely implementation of the planned improvements; and

3. Secure such funding through a dedicated portion of the gasoline taxes, or other source, in order to provide: Reassurance as to the long term commitment of the senior levels of government to public transit in the Greater Toronto Area; and to reflect the importance the respective governments place on the role of public transit in ensuring the long term economic, social and environmental health of the Greater Toronto Area.

**THAT** this resolution be forwarded to all municipalities of the GTA for endorsement.

The full resolution forms Attachment No. 2 to this report.

The resolution offers Vaughan and the other GTA municipalities a further opportunity to advise the Provincial and Federal Governments of: The importance of public transit to the future health of our communities; the critical role the senior levels of government can play in the financing of the systems; and the importance of consistent long term funding to doing comprehension planning, in conjunction with the timely implementation of the required infrastructure.

3. Update on Related Matters

Toronto Transit Commission - Rapid Transit Expansion Study (RTES)

On August 29, 2001, the Toronto Transit Commission had before it the "Rapid Transit Expansion Study" (RTES). The purpose of the study was to determine what rapid transit (subway, SRT) system expansions would make sense from the perspective of the TTC over the next ten to fifteen years, if funding came available. The study re-iterated the long held TTC position that system expansions should not be considered until the capital funding required to maintain the current system has been addressed. Presently there is a projected capital shortfall of \$1.6 billion over the next ten years.

A number of expansion alternatives were considered. In the TTC's evaluation criteria, two projects ranked the highest. These were: An extension of the Spadina subway from Downsview Station through York University to Steeles Avenue; and three variations of the extension of Sheppard Line. The cost comparison of these projects is shown below.

- **Spadina Subway, One Alternative:**  
Downsview to Steeles (6.1 km, 4 stations, \$975 million)
- **Sheppard Subway, Three Alternatives:**  
Don Mills to Victoria Park (2.1 km, 2 stations, \$420 million);  
Don Mills to CN/CP (5.5 km, 5 stations, \$1.05 billion);  
Don Mills to Scarborough City Centre (8.0 km, 7 stations, \$1.535 billion)

It is noted that a full extension of the Spadina Line to the Corporate Centre would cost approximately \$1.4 billion. The report recognized that an extension of the Spadina Subway to Steeles Avenue could be a first stage in a full extension to the Vaughan Corporate Centre, using the right of way identified in the "Higher Order Transit Corridor Protection Study - Vaughan Corporate Centre to York University" and protected in OPA No. 529.

The RTES formed the basis for a Staff Report to the Toronto Transit Commission. TTC Staff recommended the following actions:

1. Report be received for information and that staff proceed with the next steps identified in the RTES Executive Summary;
2. Confirm that the TTC's basic capital needs have been met before consideration is given to funding any rapid transit expansion projects;
3. Confirm that, if all TTC's base capital needs were fully funded then, "the TTC's highest priority for rapid transit expansion would be either a northerly extension of the Spadina Subway to York University/Steeles Avenue, or an easterly extension of

## SPECIAL COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES (2) – OCTOBER 1 2001

---

the Spadina Subway (to Victoria Park, CN/CP, or the Scarborough Town Centre).”

4. Circulate the RTES for comment by November 30, 2001 to among others, the Region of York, Vaughan, Markham, Richmond Hill and York University;
5. Forward the Report to the City of Toronto Planning and Transportation Committee.

The “next steps” referenced above, were considered necessary by TTC Staff to further evaluate the recommended options; these included:

- Undertake detailed ridership projections for the options based on population and employment projections for a 3.1 million population scenario;
- Undertake analysis of routing options for a Keele Street alignment (on the Spadina Line) and Consumer’s Road (on the Sheppard Line);
- Undertake a detailed study of downtown development scenarios and the required GO and rapid transit capacity needs in the core;
- Prepare a detailed business case analysis for each of the preferred options based on an assessment of vehicle, yard, property requirements, operating cost and forecast revenues.

Following these analyses a recommendation would be made concerning which of the alternatives should be given the highest priority. It is expected that this work will take approximately six months, resulting in a further report to the Toronto Transit Commission. During this time TTC Staff will also work to identify opportunities to implement Bus Rapid Transit in the Yonge Street corridor north of Finch Avenue and in the “Downsview Station to York University and Vaughan corridor as a precursor to rapid transit.”

The Toronto Transit Commission approved the Staff recommendation.

The RTES also noted that a Yonge Street subway extension rated well amongst the alternatives. However there is the fear that an extension of the line may overload the available capacity (ridership at 27,000 riders/peak AM hr. in 2001, practical capacity 32,000 riders/hr.). To better balance ridership between the Yonge and Spadina Lines, it was concluded that it would be better to build the Spadina Line north of Finch first, potentially attracting up to 2,500 AM peak hour passengers away from Yonge Street, thus providing capacity to allow for a future extension of the Yonge Street Line to the Langstaff Gateway in Richmond Hill.

### Recent and Planned Activities of the Spadina-York Subway Extension Committee

The Committee has been active on a number of fronts since its formation and additional activities are being planned.

A successful News Conference was held in the fall of 2000 to launch the Committee and the project. Throughout the fall of 2000 and the winter and spring of 2001, the Committee has been meeting with key political decision makers at the municipal, provincial and federal level to inform them of the proposal and to garner support. The Committee initiated a debate on transit issues at the Vaughan Chamber of Commerce all-candidates meeting during the spring provincial by-election and appeared at the TTC meeting in August in support of the ‘RTES’ which identified the Spadina-York Subway Extension as a priority.

The Committee is continuing its promotional work with the launch of a new interactive web-site this fall, which will allow residents an opportunity for input into solving the GTA’s traffic problems. Members of the Committee intend to appear at the City of Toronto Planning and Transportation Committee meeting in October when the TTC RTES is considered and again when the Business Case is discussed in November.



**Conclusion**

Council is being requested to take two actions, which will support the on-going campaign to improve transit services in the Greater Toronto Area. The first measure involves endorsing the “Spadina - York Subway Extension - Business Case: A solution for Gridlock in the Northwestern GTA” document. This will confirm Council’s already substantial commitment to the work of the Spadina - York Subway Extension Committee and give the Business Case greater standing when presented to the public, technical agencies and political authorities.

The resolution is another means for GTA municipalities to express the desire for the Provincial and Federal Governments to again become partners in the funding of public transit. Clearly, the present arrangements are inadequate and need to be revisited. The resolution supports the notion of provincial and federal involvement in the funding of transit on a consistent and long term basis, potentially using a dedicated source, such as a portion of the respective gasoline taxes.

The report concludes with an update on the TTC’s “Rapid Transit Expansion Study”. The results of the study are encouraging in that it sees the Spadina Subway extension to Steeles Avenue as one of two higher priority projects should funding become available for system expansion. This highlights the importance of endorsing the business case, as the TTC will be embarking on the preparation of its own business case studies for the Spadina and Sheppard Ave. subway extensions as part of its further analysis. It is hoped that the Business Case, as endorsed by Council, can assist in persuading the TTC and others as to the merit of the Spadina Subway extension project.

Finally, the recent and planned actions of the Spadina-York Subway Extensions Committee were summarized for the information of Council.

On this basis, it is recommended that Council take the actions set out in the “Recommendation” section of this report.

**Attachments**

1. Executive Summary - “Spadina - York Subway Extension - Business Case: A solution for Gridlock in the Northwestern GTA”
2. Draft Resolution

**Report prepared by:**

Roy McQuillin, Senior Planner - Special Studies (ext. 8211)  
Victoria Leskie, Director of Corporate Communications (ext. 8288)

/LG

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

**242. CONFIRMING BY-LAW**

MOVED by Regional Councillor Frustaglio  
seconded by Councillor Ferri

THAT By-law Number 395 -2001, being a by-law to confirm the proceedings of Council at its meeting on October 1, 2001, be read a First, Second and Third time and enacted.

CARRIED

**243. ADJOURNMENT**

MOVED by Regional Councillor Frustaglio  
seconded by Councillor Kadis

THAT the meeting adjourn at 6:15 p.m.

CARRIED

---

M. Di Biase, Acting Mayor

---

J. D. Leach, City Clerk