

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE (WORKING SESSION) JANUARY 28, 2003

CITY OF VAUGHAN CIVIC CENTRE ANALYSIS OF ALTERNATIVE LOCATIONS PRESENTATIONS AND WRITTEN SUBMISSIONS

Recommendation

The Commissioner of Planning recommends:

That the presentations and written submissions prepared in respect of the three prospective civic centre sites BE RECEIVED;

That Staff conduct a detailed analysis of the submissions and report back to a future Committee of the Whole (Working Session) at first opportunity to report on the results of the analysis and to identify the options for further action;

That Staff retain external expertise as required, to assist in the analysis of financial issues and to advise on process/negotiation matters related to the acquisition of a site and/or facility; and that the source of funding be identified as the reserve for City Hall; and

That Council provide direction on the composition and role of the proposed civic centre task force, to be created to deal with the civic centre issue.

Purpose

The purpose of this report is to provide Committee of the Whole with background information as context for three presentations, which will be heard at this meeting. The presentations relate to the three potential civic centre locations identified by Council at its December 16, 2002 meeting. The locations under consideration include the present Civic Centre Site, the McNaughton Road Site and the Weston Road (Vellore) Site. The presentations and accompanying submissions (Attachments 1, 2 and 3) illustrate the potential development form for each of the sites and how the developments may be implemented from a business perspective.

Staff are also seeking direction to proceed with more detailed analysis of the three options and on the composition of a task force that would deal with the civic centre issue.

Background - Analysis and Options

Previous Council Action

On May 13, 2002 Council directed that qualified external assistance be retained to prepare a detailed benefit-cost analysis in respect of the two options identified as "moderate mixed-use focus" in the "City Hall Location Study" (April 2002), prepared by Sorenson Gravely Lowes Planning Associates Inc. The two areas identified for consideration were the Vellore District Centre and the Vaughan Corporate Centre.

In July of 2002 a team led by the management consultant KPMG LLP was retained to conduct the benefit-cost analysis. Assisting KPMG were the firms the Ventin Group (architecture), the McCormick Rankin Corporation (transportation) and Forhan Rogers (planning).

On August 12, 2002, Council received a request from York Major Holdings Inc. to consider a third Civic Centre alternative. The subject site is located at the northwest corner of Major Mackenzie Drive and the planned extension of McNaughton Road. In addition to a civic centre, the concept plan included a hospital/healthcare facility. On September 23, 2002, Council considered a motion proposing that this third area be added for consideration in the benefit-cost analysis.

At its September 23, 2002 meeting, Council adopted the following motion:

- 1) That staff be directed to meet with representatives of the Simcoe-York District Health Council, the Regional Municipality of York, York Central Hospital and the Ministry of Health and Long Term Care to discuss the feasibility of establishing a hospital or related health care facility in the City of Vaughan;
- 2) That staff report back to Council on the results of the deliberations at first opportunity; and
- 3) That in the interim KPMG L.L.P. add the proposed civic centre site located at the northwest corner of Major Mackenzie Drive and the planned expansion of McNaughton Road, which includes a hospital and medical component, to the cost-benefit analysis of the two alternative civic centre sites now under consideration and that the budget be expanded to include the analysis of this alternative.

On September 24, 2002 the consultant presented its interim report to Committee of the Whole at a Working Session. Committee of the Whole recommended that the Staff Report and the presentation by KPMG LLP be received. Council ratified this recommendation on October 15, 2002. The presentation dealt with the two sites initially identified on May 13, 2002.

At the October 29, 2002 Committee of the Whole (Working Session) KPMG LLP presented the results of the draft final report. This analysis included the third alternative site (Major Mackenzie Drive and McNaughton Road) that was added by Council on September 23, 2002. Committee of the Whole approved the Staff recommendation and directed that the matter be referred to Staff for a comprehensive report incorporating the comments of Members of Council. Council ratified this decision on November 11, 2002.

On December 10, 2002 Committee of the Whole (Working Session) recommended that the final report of KPMG LLP, entitled "City of Vaughan Civic Centre Benefit Cost Analysis of Alternative Locations" be received. In consideration of the report and subsequent deliberations, the following recommendations were adopted:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Commissioner of Planning, dated December 10, 2002, be approved;
- 2) That the new Vaughan Civic Centre (City Hall) be located along the Major Mackenzie corridor, bounded by Weston Road on the west and Dufferin Street on the east;
- 3) That staff further explore the opportunities of the various sites being, the present Civic Centre site, the McNaughton Road site and the Weston Road site;
- 4) That staff outline the advantages and disadvantages of each site, meet with the appropriate landowners, and bring forward a report, with appropriate steps to follow, by mid January 2003;
- 5) That a Task Force be established in January 2003, to deal with the civic centre issue, and that consultants be hired on an as needed basis;

Council ratified the recommendations of Committee of the Whole on December 16, 2002 and included the following motion:

That staff provide a report to a Committee of the Whole meeting in January 2003, outlining the steps required to form a multi-disciplinary study group consisting of all stakeholders to the issue, so as to achieve the development of a health care centre in the City of Vaughan.

The Presentations – Committee of the Whole (Working Session), January 28, 2003

Two of the three prospective civic centre sites are privately owned. For this reason it will be important to compare the opportunities available at these sites along with those that are already available at the current location. The two private landowners (The History Hill Group (Greenpark Homes) – the Weston Road (Vellore) Site and York Major Holdings Inc. – the McNaughton Road Site) have both expressed interest in working with the City to provide a site for a new civic centre. The City has retained the services of the Ventin Group Architects to examine the potential of the current civic centre site to accommodate the City's long-term needs.

In order to assist in the comparison, each has been requested to make a two-part submission to the City. The first part will be a presentation to Committee of the Whole. This (Working Session) meeting will allow the landowners to present their conceptual development and business proposals for consideration; and the City's consulting architect will do a presentation on the development potential of the current site and the resulting costs. Each presentation will be supported by a written submission, which will form the basis for further review by City. The written submissions form Attachments 1, 2 and 3 to this report.

The receipt of this information will open a new stage in the process. The City will now be in a position to evaluate the landowners' site-specific business proposals vis a vis the business case for redeveloping the City's current civic centre property. It will be necessary to give this information close scrutiny in order to ensure that Council has an understanding of the financial strengths and weaknesses of each option prior to a decision being made. Therefore, it is being recommended that the City retain external consulting resources to assist Staff in analyzing the business and financial aspects of the alternatives. Legal assistance will also be necessary to assist in defining the steps leading to a decision and potentially, to assist in the negotiation of any agreements to acquire property and/or a building.

On December 16, 2002, Council determined that there was a need to form a task force to deal with the civic centre issue. The task force could take on a number of forms. It could be a technical advisory committee, which would be composed of Staff and led by the Senior Management Team. Alternatively, the task force could be made up of members of Council, with Staff, through the Senior Management Team, providing technical advice. A third alternative would provide for a mixed task force that includes both Councillors and Staff. Staff are seeking direction on the preferred role and composition of the task force.

It is noted that the presentations, the written submissions and the deliberations of the Committee relate to the proposed or pending acquisition of land for municipal or local board purposes. Therefore, it is recommended that the Committee move into Closed Session to hear the presentations and discuss the submissions.

Conclusion

The presentations and written submissions will provide more definitive information on how the potential sites will address the City's needs. Ultimately, each will have to be evaluated from a number of perspectives. These would include matters such as location and context, site function and access, civic presence and financial impact. Therefore it is recommended that Council receive the submissions and direct Staff to conduct a detailed analysis of the submitted information. Upon completion of the analysis Staff will report back with options for further action.

In addition, it is being recommended that Staff retain external expertise to assist in the preparation of an in-depth analysis of the business aspects of the alternatives and to advise in the areas of process and negotiation.

Should Council concur with this approach, then the recommendation set out above should be adopted.

Attachments

FOR COUNCILLORS ONLY:

1. McNaughton Road Site: "Vaughan Civic Centre", Page+Steele, Architects Planners for York Major Holdings Inc.
2. Current Civic Centre Site: "Vaughan Civic Centre Existing Site Feasibility Study, 2141 Major Mackenzie Drive, Vaughan, Ontario", The Ventin Group Architects for the City of Vaughan
3. Weston Road/Vellore Site: "Submission for Civic Centre Site at Major Mackenzie Drive & Highway 400 (Northwest Quadrant), A New Focus for the City Above Toronto", Joseph Bogden Associates Inc. for the History Hill Group.

Report prepared by:

Roy McQuillin, Manager of Corporate Policy, ext. 8211

Respectfully submitted,

MICHAEL DeANGELIS
Commissioner of Planning

/CM

R:\SER\WORKING\MCQUILLR\CivicCentreCoW(WS)Jan28.doc