

**COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE – WORKING SESSION – NOVEMBER 15, 2005**

**ANIMAL CONTROL SERVICES**

**Recommendation**

The Commissioner of Legal and Administrative Services, in conjunction with the Senior Manager of Enforcement Services, recommends:

1. That Council direct staff to negotiate either independently or as a joint effort with those other municipalities that choose this option with Kennel Inn to provide the desired level of service that will meet the demands of the municipality and its residents; and
2. That the committee report back to the applicable Councils on the results of the negotiations by March 31, 2006; and
3. That the Senior Manager of Enforcement Services, if required, be authorized to extend the current contract with Kennel Inn until no later than March 31, 2006.

**Economic Impact**

The current cost of Animal Control may increase substantially over the coming years from the 2005 rate of \$1.65 per capita, to a projected future rate of close to \$4.00 per capita.

**Purpose**

To provide information relating to Animal Control Services and future contract negotiations.

**Background - Analysis and Options**

In December 2003, Council directed staff to investigate the establishment of a joint facility with those municipalities that had existing contracts with Kennel Inn to provide animal control and sheltering services.

The process of examining the service level of animal control in Vaughan started in November of 2003 as the result of complaints and concerns from a group of residents. Vaughan along with 4 other municipalities in York Region and one municipality in Simcoe County, contract their animal control service and enforcement of their animal control by-laws to Kennel Inn. These municipalities are Aurora, King, Markham, Richmond Hill, and the City of Vaughan from York Region, and the Towns of Bradford and West Gwillimbury from Simcoe County.

The group of residents approached the municipal Councils of five York Region municipalities and presented their concerns. Their complaints and concerns were with respect to the condition of Kennel Inn's facility, including the entrance to the property, the driveway and the conditions that the animals are being subjected to while under the care of Kennel Inn. As a result of the complaints and direction from the five municipal Councils, those municipalities came together in December of 2003 to form an Ad Hoc Committee.

The committee was directed to examine how to improve the level of service to the public, provide a more modern and up-to-date facility and to examine the feasibility of constructing and operating a joint facility located centrally within the five municipalities.

Kennel Inn operates from a property located in the south end of Aurora. The company has been under contract for more than 13 years with Vaughan, Aurora, King, Markham, Richmond Hill, Bradford and West Gwillimbury, and during that time has operated from the same location west off of Yonge Street, just north of Bloomington Side Road.

The Ministry of Agriculture and Food inspects all animal shelters and pounds on a regular basis in accordance with the Pound Keepers Act and have given the Kennel Inn facility a passing grade over the entire time that they have provided the service to the municipalities.

The committee has since performed an exhaustive search into all possible options for the provision of animal control services. The following is a summary of the work carried out by the committee since starting the process in December of 2003.

Members of the committee have visited a number of animal shelters including those in Durham Region, the cities of Brampton, Kingston, London, Mississauga and Toronto and the Towns of Caledon and Georgina.

In addition to visiting these facilities, the Committee has met with various animal-related organizations including The Toronto Wildlife Centre, Earth Rangers, the O.S.P.C.A., the Aurora Pet Care Association and the Manager of Animal Services for the City of Calgary.

As a result of the research and discussions with their municipal Purchasing Department staff, the committee made a recommendation to their respective Councils that a joint Expression of Interest (EOI) be released to solicit innovative proposals for animal control services. The EOI was released on December 9<sup>th</sup>, 2004 by the City of Vaughan on behalf of the 5 municipalities. A total of 3 submissions were received from the EOI process. The submissions were from Kennel Inn, Earth Rangers and The Toronto Wildlife Centre. The responses were reviewed by the committee and with all of the Councils' approval, a Request for Proposal was released to the three respondents on May 8, 2005 by the Town of Aurora on behalf of all of the municipalities. All three respondents submitted proposals. The committee reviewed the submissions with the Aurora Supplies and Services staff who reported that all 3 submissions were unacceptable and were deemed informal. Each of the submissions failed to meet one or more of the requirements of the R.F.P.

The Committee also investigated the feasibility of building a joint facility, the costs of land, construction and furnishing the facility as well as the operational costs associated with providing the animal control services for the five municipalities (see Appendices 'A', 'B' and 'C'). In doing the research for this option, the committee used three existing shelters as examples. A small shelter (Caledon) to service a population of approximately 60,000 residents, a medium shelter (Brampton) to service a population of approximately 300,000 residents and a large shelter (Calgary) to service a population of approximately 950,000 residents. The costs of construction for each of these facilities is the actual cost based on the year of construction. Today's costs would be higher as a result of the increase in cost of living and the increased cost of materials. The summary of costs for a joint facility (see Appendix 'C') is based on the current costs as reported by the industry. The actual cost of construction may be higher and is dependent on when construction commences.

Appendix "E" outlines the cost break down for each municipality should a municipal shelter be constructed and operated.

As Richmond Hill prepared the appendices, the operational costs are based on the present salaries of the Town of Richmond Hill and the current costs for the equipment and vehicles. These are the minimum costs and will increase on a yearly basis due to inflation and salary increases. The costs of the utilities are based on the present costs for those items.

During the period since December 2003, the contracts of each of the municipalities have expired and all have entered into short term contracts or agreements with Kennel Inn to provide the services on a month-to-month basis.

Appendix "D" provides an overview of the cost of animal control services in some GTA municipalities.

The Committee has also provided cursory information on a number of options for Council's information.

OPTION	COST OF OPTION
Build and operate a joint facility	Construction Costs \$2,642,000. Ann. Operating Costs \$3,024,535.
Re-open discussions with Caledon to utilize their shelter facility and operate animal control services with City staff	Estimated cost of approximately \$350,000. per year
Negotiate an extension of the contract with Kennel Inn (provided all 5 municipalities participate in the negotiation)	Estimated costs \$390,000. (\$1.65 per capita) - \$940,000. (\$3.93 per capita) Dependant on the services and rates agreed to
Re-tender the contract for animal control services	Same as #3
Enter into a Public-Private Partnership with another municipality	Construction Costs Annual Operating Costs
Enter into an individual Public-Private Partnership	Construction Costs Annual Operating Costs

The financial implications of future animal control services will depend on the option that is selected. Currently, the City pays \$389,280.00. per year for the provision of animal control services.

**Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2007**

This report is in keeping with Vaughan Vision by delivering the best service possible. This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council and the necessary resources have been allocated and approved.

## **Conclusion**

Although it would be desirable to own and operate a City facility, the cost is prohibitive and it would take the municipalities in excess of 2 years to purchase the land, design and build an adequate facility with room to grow in the future and that would address the needs of the residents.

It is therefore the recommendation of the Ad Hoc Committee that Council direct staff to negotiate, in a joint effort with those other municipalities that so choose, with Kennel Inn to:

1. provide the desired level of service that will meet the demands of the residents;
2. reach an agreement on a location for a new facility that can accommodate the municipalities present and future needs;
3. to agree on a date that the new facility will open for operation;
4. in the interim, Kennel Inn will make the necessary improvements to the existing facility that will provide a better environment for the animals and the residents that visit the facility;
5. Kennel Inn will work with the committee to ensure the proper and adequate training of staff on the handling of the animals and for the enforcement of the animal control by-laws is provided;
6. And further that the committee report back to the Councils on the results of the negotiations by March 31, 2006.

## **Attachments**

Appendix 'A'	Construction costs spreadsheet for Brampton, Caledon and Calgary
Appendix 'B'	Operating costs spreadsheet for Brampton, Caledon and Calgary
Appendix 'C'	Joint Municipally-owned facility construction costs analysis
Appendix 'D'	Animal Control Current Cost Comparison
Appendix 'E'	Joint Facility Cost Split Per Capita

## **Report prepared by:**

Tony Thompson  
Senior Manager of Enforcement Services

Respectfully submitted,

Robert J. Swayze  
Commissioner of Legal and Administrative Services

**APPENDIX 'A'**

**FACILITY CONSTRUCTION and START-UP COSTS SURVEY  
FOR THE MUNICIPALITIES OF  
BRAMPTON, CALEDON, CALGARY.**

<b>PARTICULARS</b>	<b>BRAMPTON</b>	<b>CALEDON</b>	<b>CALGARY</b>
Population	380,000	57,000	950,000
Property Size	3 acres	2 acres 10 acres	2.5 acres
Year of Construction	1998	2002	2002
Land Acquisition Cost	Municipal	Donation	
Soft costs – Architect, Consultant, legal, etc.		\$30,000 \$21,000	
Moving Costs		22,000	
Facility Size	18,000 sq ft	3200 sq ft	21,000 sq ft
Cost to Equip & Décor.- Admin Furniture Computers & Office Equipment		\$30,000 \$30,000	
Cost to Equip – Pound area	\$58,500 +/-	\$10,000	\$1000 per cage
Exterior Facilities	\$100,000 +/-	\$40,000	
Cost of Driveway & Parking lot	Included above	\$24,440	
Cost of Landscaping		\$26,659	
<b>Cost of Construction</b>	<b>\$1,200,000</b>	<b>\$538,209</b>	<b>\$3,500,000</b>
Vehicle Costs	Leased	\$15,000 1 yr Lease 2 Vehicles	\$90,000 p/v Purchased & equipped
Miscellaneous Costs      Permits Printing		\$4,300 \$2,000	
<b>SUMMARY</b>	<b>BRAMPTON</b>	<b>CALEDON</b>	<b>CALGARY</b>
Construction Costs	\$1,200,000	\$538,209	\$3,500,000
Other Charges	\$ 150,000	\$105,744	
Initial Operating Charges	\$ 100,000	\$ 70,000	
<b>TOTAL COST – Including GST</b>	<b>\$1,450,000 +/-</b>	<b>\$742,000</b>	<b>\$3,500,000</b>

**APPENDIX 'B'**

**COST OF PROGRAM SURVEY  
FOR THE MUNICIPALITIES OF  
CALEDON, CALGARY, BRAMPTON**

Aurora, King, Markham, Richmond Hill & Vaughan

<b>PARTICULARS</b>	<b>CALEDON</b>	<b>CALGARY</b>	<b>BRAMPTON</b>
Number of Full Time Staff	4	22	16
Number of Part Time Staff	3		7
<b>SALARIES</b>			
Overtime	\$176,000		\$206,728
Benefits	\$ 25,000		\$193,390
Worker Compensation	\$ 42,000		\$ 5969
<b>TOTAL SALARIES</b>	<b>\$242,700</b>		<b>\$1,097,139</b>
Uniforms/Safety Equip.	\$2,000		\$5,350
Training/Education	\$2,000		\$6,200
Memberships	\$300		\$400
Cell phones			
Radio – Dispatch Service	\$4,000		\$6,400
Vehicle & Maintenance	Lease \$15,000 3 Vehicles		\$49,242
Mileage	\$200		\$250
Fuel	\$???		\$22,600
<b>Pound Supplies</b>			
Maintenance	\$6,000		\$37,600
Dog Food	\$2,500		Included
Cat Food	Incl		
Other Expense	\$2,000		Included
Medical Supplies	\$6,000		
Office and Pound Stationary And other office materials	\$2,000		\$37,600
<b>Administration Expenses</b>			Included in office
Phones	\$4,000		exp.
Hydro	\$6,000		\$24,000
Gas/Oil	\$12,000		\$39,006
Water/Sewers	\$1,500		\$3,100
Taxes	Nil		
Computer Service	\$1,000		
Veterinary Services	\$3,000		
Burial/Cremation			In House
Wildlife Services			In House
<b>Other Expenses</b>			
Contract Services	\$700		\$16,000
Live Stock Control	\$3,000		
Spay/Neuter	\$1,200		
Printing/advertising	\$1,500		\$10,000
Insurance	\$7,900		\$ 000 ?
<b>TOTAL EXPENSES</b>	<b>\$328,209</b>		<b>\$1,604,149</b>

<b>REVENUES</b>			
Revenues	Licence Sales	\$42,000	\$110,000
	Boarding Fees	\$14,000	\$ 10,000
	Adoptions	\$10,000	\$117,800
	Kennel Licenses	\$2,000	
	Additional	\$10,000	\$ 57,000
<b>TOTAL REVENUES</b>		<b>\$81,510</b>	<b>\$304,800</b>
Yearly Operating Budget			
	Expenses	\$329,000	\$3,500,000
	Revenues	[\$81,500]	[\$3,500,000]
<b>NET PROGRAM</b>		<b>\$247,500</b>	<b>0</b>
			<b>\$1,299,349</b>

**APPENDIX 'C'**

**JOINT FACILITY  
CONSTRUCTION & EQUIPMENT COSTS**

Cost to purchase land in the area of the lower 6 municipalities;	
- Serviced lands no 404 exposure.	\$475,000
- Serviced lands with 404 exposure.	\$500,000 +

Construction costs for Industrial/Commercial structures (min. 25,000 sq. ft.)  
Size based on providing service for 5 to 7 municipalities plus growth  
for 10 years.

- Cost per square foot.	\$ 58.00
- Hard Costs – Actual Construction	(25,000 sq ft X \$58.00)
	\$ 1,450,000

Admin area =	5000 sq ft
Entrance & Reception Area =	750 sq ft
Lunch Room/Kitchen =	400 sq ft
Staff Locker Room/Change Room – Men =	300 sq ft
Staff Locker Room/Change Room – Women =	300 sq ft
Staff Washrooms =	550 sq ft
Public Washrooms =	250 sq ft
Animal Baths & Grooming Area =	175 sq ft
Animal Receiving Area =	150 sq ft
Drive-in Receiving Garage (2 vehicles) =	1000 sq ft
Freezer & Storage Room =	300 sq ft
Utility Room =	250 sq ft
Adoption area Dogs =	1500 sq ft
Adoption area Cats =	1000 sq ft
Dog Cages =	4000 sq ft
Cat Cages =	4000 sq ft
Other Cages =	1000 sq ft
Quarantine area cages for Dogs	1000 sq ft
Quarantine area cages for Cats	1000 sq ft
Storage area =	750 sq ft
Misc area – halls, closets etc.	1000 sq ft

HVAC Systems + Air Exchange System for Kennels \$ 100,000+/-

Cost per square foot. Soft Costs – Architect, Consultant, etc. \$ 60,000  
(4% of Construction Cost)

Costs for equipment – cages, counters, tables, office equipment, etc.	
Cost per work station (Desk, phone, computer, etc.)	
(\$ 8,000 per station X 10 stations)	\$ 80,000
(\$ 1,000 per Cage 100 Cats)	\$ 100,000
(\$ 1,000 Custom Made doors )	\$ 85,000



Decorations – paintings, etc.	\$ 15,000
Landscaping Costs – (Depends on site plan requirements).	\$ 30,000 +/-
Fencing – Runs & Exercise Areas	\$ 15,000 +/-
Outdoor Kennels & Runs (75)	\$ 150,000
Outdoor Cat Area (25 x 25) Enclosed	\$ 25,000
Driveway and walkways Cost - (Depends on site plan requirements)	\$ 65,000 +/-
Signs - Business & Directional =	\$ 2,500 +/-
<b>TOTAL CONSTRUCTION COSTS</b>	<b><u>\$ 2,642,500+/-</u></b>

**OPERATING COSTS (per year @ todays costs Richmond Hill salaries & benefits)**

Salaries – Admin.	Manager – per year, including benefits (23% of salary)	\$100,000
	2 Supervisors – per year, including benefits ( 23%) (\$70,000 + Benefits \$86,000 X 2 )	\$172,000
	4 Clerks – per year, including benefits (23% of salary) (\$30,000 + Benefits \$ \$37,000 X 4 )	\$150,000
	4 Kennel Staff – per year, including benefits (23%) (\$30,000 + Benefits \$ \$37,000 X 4 )	\$150,000
	Enforcement – per year, including benefits. (23% of salary) (\$ 68,000 includes Benefits 23%)	
	8 Officers for 5 municipalities	\$544,000
	12 Officers for 5 municipalities	\$816,000
Cell Phones (Contract costs vary)	12 phones	\$1,000
Radio System Purchase		\$7,000
Vehicle Costs	Full size van style - Lease Rate per year cost	\$ 52,800
	Aurora - 1 van	(\$450 p/m X 12 = \$ 5400)
	King - 1 van	
	Markham - 2 vans	(\$5400 X 9 = \$48,600)
	Richmond Hil - 2 vans	
	Vaughan - 2 vans	
	Spare - 1 van	
	Supervisor Patrol Vehicle –	(\$ 350 p/m X 12= \$ 4200)
Regular costs associated with daily use – gas (10 vehicles)		\$60,000
	- misc. other	\$10,000
Maintenance Cost – Regular maintenance,		\$ 7,500
	Equipment replacement (Brakes, tires, etc.)	\$ 5,000

**COSTS FOR SHELTER OPERATION**

Costs include all utility usage costs, office expenses, maintenance expenses, training & staff development costs and other miscellaneous charges.  
(based on estimates calculated at 2005 rates)

\$950,000+/-

**TOTAL COST** per year based on present salary and equipment costs

**\$ 3,024,500**

***TOTAL CONSTRUCTION + 1<sup>ST</sup> YEAR COSTS – CAPITAL + OPERATING***

**\$ 5,607,000**

**APPENDIX 'D'**

**ANIMAL CONTROL COST COMPARISON  
2004 Statistics**

<b>MUNICIPALITY</b>	<b>POPULATION</b>	<b>ANIMAL CONTROL BUDGET</b>	<b>COST PER CAPITA</b>
BARRIE (OSPCA)	125,000	\$291,000.00	\$2.33
BRAMPTON	370,000	\$1,600,000.00	\$4.32
CALEDON	53,000	\$325,000.00	\$6.13
GEORGINA	32,000	\$220,000.00	\$6.88
UXBRIDGE	45,000	\$174,000.00	\$3.87
MISSISSAUGA	640,000	\$1,200,000.00	\$1.88
OAKVILLE	130,000	\$550,000.00	\$4.23
PAWS PICKERING/AJAX/WHITBY	152,000	\$753,000.00	\$3.00
<b>TOTAL GTA</b>	<b>1,647,000</b>	<b>\$5,133,000.00</b>	<b>\$3.86</b>
<b>KENNEL INN 2005</b>			
AURORA	46,500	\$134,000	\$2.88
KING	19,500	\$ 87,000	\$4.46
MARKHAM	263,200	\$250,000	\$0.95
RICHMOND HILL	162,000	\$194,200	\$1.20
VAUGHAN	240,000	\$385,000	\$1.60
<b>TOTAL KENNEL INN</b>	<b>731,200</b>	<b>\$1,050,200</b>	<b>\$1.43</b>

**APPENDIX 'E'**

**COST SPLIT BY MUNICIPALITY**

**Based on Per Capita  
2005 Statistics**

	POPULATION	CONSTRUCTION	OPERATION	TOTAL
AURORA	46,500	\$ 168,042	\$ 192,342	\$ 360,384
KING	19,500	\$ 70,469	\$ 80,660	\$ 151,129
MARKHAM	263,200	\$ 951,152	\$1,088,700	\$2,039,852
RICHMOND HILL	162,000	\$ 585,435	\$ 670,097	\$1,255,532
VAUGHAN	240,000	\$ 867,312	\$ 992,736	\$1,860,048
<b>TOTAL POPULATION</b>	<b>731,200</b>	<b>\$ 2,642,410</b>	<b>\$3,024,535</b>	<b>\$5,666,945</b>

TOTAL POPULATION            731,200

TOTAL COST                    \$5,666,945     (cost divided by population = cost per capita)

COST PER CAPITA FOR CONSTRUCTION OF JOINT FACILITY     = \$ 3.61

COST PER CAPITA FOR 1<sup>ST</sup> YEAR OPERATING COSTS             = \$ 4.14

**Total                             = \$7.75 per capita**