

## **BUDGET COMMITTEE - FEBRUARY 25, 2008**

### **2008 CAPITAL BUDGET AMENDMENT – MCNAUGHTON PREMIUM SOCCER FIELD**

#### **Recommendation**

The Commissioner of Community Services in consultation with the Directors of Reserves and Investments and Parks Development recommends:

- 1) That Budget Committee provide direction on whether to facilitate the conversion of the existing McNaughton premium soccer field (capital project PK-6214-08) to an artificial turf soccer field or to rehabilitate to a natural turf soccer field; and,
- 2) That the operating budget be amended to reflect the \$20,000 annual savings in maintenance costs; and,
- 3) That once the artificial turf soccer field is operational, the net difference in revenues received from the rental of the McNaughton premium soccer field versus that of revenues from the artificial turf soccer field be deposited in a special reserve to offset future major artificial turf rehabilitation costs.

#### **Economic Impact**

Additional funding in the amount of \$781,250 is required to augment the funds allocated in capital project PK-6214-08 McNaughton Premium Soccer Field (\$377,500) and the financial commitment by the Vaughan Soccer Club Inc. of \$120,000. Annual operating costs totaling \$6,000 (currently \$26,000) will be required should the artificial turf soccer field be constructed.

#### **Communications Plan**

As a potential funding partner, the Vaughan Soccer Club will be informed of the Budget Committee's decision regarding the conversion of the existing McNaughton premium soccer field to an artificial turf soccer field.

#### **Purpose**

The purpose of this report is to seek Budget Committee direction on whether to facilitate the conversion of the existing McNaughton premium soccer field (capital project PK-6214-08) to an artificial turf soccer field or to rehabilitate to a natural turf soccer field.

#### **Background - Analysis and Options**

Soccer is currently the number one organized sport in Ontario with respect to participation numbers. Annual increases in the number of participants are no longer an unexpected surprise. This growth indicates a very promising future for Vaughan's soccer organizations. However, the reality is that many participants may possibly be turned away due to lack of playing facilities. In order to meet the growing demands, new fields must be constructed or field usage times must be expanded (or a combination of both).

The following information outlines both the benefits/advantages and the disadvantages for natural turf fields and for artificial turf fields.

## **Natural Turf Soccer Fields**

Given the pressures to provide time allocations for soccer fields, there is ongoing discussion regarding use of the fields during inclement weather versus having quality fields that can be maintained within reasonable operating budget. Natural turf soccer fields are permitted from mid-May through to the end of September and as such, potential revenue generation is limited to this 4.5 month period. Use of natural turf fields is entirely dependant upon weather conditions and play is restricted during and immediately following rain storms in order to protect the fields from damage and avoid costly repairs.

One of the difficulties with natural fields is that there is a significant cost to build them (approx. \$339,900 depending on existing site conditions). To build a natural turf premium soccer field, the site must be rough graded, drainage installed, top soiled (with appropriate soil mixture), fine graded to allow for proper surface drainage construction, sodded, fenced, irrigated and lined.

The greatest drawback to a natural turf field is the high cost of annual maintenance (\$26,000) required to keep these facilities operational and safe. Natural turf fields wear in the same location and the turf is continually in need of replacement and repair to ensure safe playing conditions. In order to sustain optimum, safe playing conditions, playing times must be limited (ie: 2 consecutive days of rest) and downtime for field repairs / maintenance are frequent and usually of significant duration.

Typical maintenance of turf fields includes replacement of sod in the goal mouths and at half field, grass cutting, watering, aerating, top-dressing and overseeding, irrigation repairs, fertilizing and lining and the average cost per year is approximately \$26,000. Presently, no revenue derived from permitting fees is allocated for soccer field maintenance.

## **Artificial Turf Soccer Fields**

Municipalities and private organizations (Mississauga, Oakville, Brampton, Toronto and Vaughan) are constructing artificial turf fields as an alternative to natural grass fields. The reason for this consideration is that artificial turf maximizes field usage opportunities with minimal annual maintenance requirements.

An artificial turf field provides a quality playing surface, which is subject to minimal wear and tear, is playable in all types of weather conditions, and extends the playing season dramatically. Permit allocations can be made in March, April, May, October, November and December which translates into an additional 18 weeks of potential field usage and revenue.

The maintenance required on an artificial turf field is minimal (approx. \$6,000) and consists of grooming the field twice annually to redistribute the rubber infill material. No rest period for an artificial turf field is required and downtime in order to perform maintenance is virtually eliminated. Again, field usage is maximized alleviating some of the pressure from sports groups to provide playing facilities and revenues are increased.

The greatest drawback of the artificial turf soccer field is that it does require a substantial initial capital expenditure (approx. \$1,150,000). To build an artificial turf senior soccer field the site must be rough graded, base granular installed to allow for drainage, the artificial turf material installed, and fencing, concrete curbing and lighting installed.

The artificial turf surface material will have to be replaced due to degradation every 10 - 12 years at an approximate cost of \$400,000. The granular base on which the artificial surface is installed will not have to be replaced.

## **Public/Private Partnership Commitment**

Based on concerns for player safety (referees have had to cancel games due to the condition of the field) and the excessive “down time” that the existing natural turf premium field experiences, the Vaughan Soccer Club Inc. has expressed an interest in contributing funds for the installation of an artificial turf soccer field at McNaughton Park (Attachment ‘A’). Vaughan Soccer has committed \$120,000 as a lump sum payment prior to the project tender to this public/private partnership. This funding commitment is exclusive to the conversion of the existing premium soccer field at McNaughton Park into an artificial turf soccer facility.

## **Case Study – Rental Summary Comparisons**

The Recreation Department compiled rental summary reports for the existing McNaughton premium soccer field and for Vaughan Grove artificial turf soccer field. By comparison (Attachment B), for the period of March 1, 2007 to November 30, 2007 the Vaughan Grove artificial turf soccer field had an additional 331 bookings and generated an additional \$73,345.23 in revenue over and above that of the McNaughton premium soccer field. It is anticipated that any additional revenues generated by the artificial turf field over and above that was generated by the premium field would be deposited in a special reserve to offset future major artificial turf rehabilitation costs.

## **Funding Artificial Turf Soccer Fields**

The City of Vaughan is currently in the process of preparing an updated 2003 Development Charges Background Study for the period 2008-2013. Artificial turf soccer fields are not included in the current Development Charges Background Study; but these works could be funded from Development Charges. Artificial turf soccer fields will be added as part of the 2003 Development Charges Background Study update. Should Budget Committee approve this project in the amended amount of \$1,158,750, the funding would be \$377,500 from the Parks Infrastructure, \$120,000 from Vaughan Soccer Club, \$595,125 from City Wide Development Charges – Park Development and \$66,125 from taxation. All the identified funding, with the exception of taxation, is available. If Budget Committee approves the funding these works that were not considered in the 2003 Development Charges Background Study approximately \$600,000 of future park development will be deferred to years beyond the projected 10 year timeframe identified in the 2003 Development Charges Background Study.

However, should the Budget Committee not approve the request to construct an artificial turf soccer field at McNaughton, the McNaughton soccer field still needs to be rehabilitated as a premium soccer field and \$377,500 funded from the Parks Infrastructure Reserve is still required.

## **Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020**

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council in Vaughan Vision 2020 as it “Enhances and Ensures Community Safety, Health and Wellness” as well as “Pursuing Excellence in Service Delivery”.

## **Regional Implications**

Not Applicable.

## **Conclusion**

The Vaughan Soccer Club's members have increased by 59% between 2002 and 2007. The conversion of the existing McNaughton premium soccer field to an artificial turf soccer field will offset some of the immediate needs of the Vaughan Soccer Club.

Should Budget Committee approve this project to construct an artificial soccer turf in the amended amount of \$1,158,750, the funding would be \$377,500 from the Parks Infrastructure, \$120,000 from Vaughan Soccer Club, \$595,125 from City Wide Development Charges – Park Development and \$66,125 from taxation. All the identified funding, with the exception of taxation, is available.

However, should the Budget Committee not approve the request to construct an artificial turf soccer field at McNaughton, the McNaughton soccer field still needs to be rehabilitated as a premium field and \$377,500 funded from the Parks Infrastructure Reserve is still required.

## **Attachments**

Attachment 'A' - Letter of Funding Commitment from Vaughan Soccer Club Inc.

Attachment 'B' – Rental Summary Reports (March 1, 2007 – November 30, 2007)

## **Report prepared by:**

Paul Gardner, Director of Parks Development, ext. 3209  
Ferrucio Castellarin, Director of Reserves and Investments, ext. 8271

Respectfully submitted,

Marlon Kallideen,  
Commissioner of Community Services



**AUGHAN SOCCER CLUB INC.**



P.O. BOX 852, MAPLE, ONTARIO L6A 1S8

[www.vaughansoccer.com](http://www.vaughansoccer.com)

City of Vaughan  
2141 Major Mackenzie Drive  
Vaughan, Ontario  
L6A 1T1

February 23<sup>rd</sup>, 2008

Dear Members of Council

The Vaughan Soccer Club would like to thank the City of Vaughan officials for meeting with us regarding the continued growing needs of the Vaughan Soccer Club participants.

We are writing this letter to specifically address problems that have arisen at the McNaughton Soccer Field by our club in the past several years. We understand that the 2008 budget will allocate funds for the repair of the McNaughton Field to bring up to playing standard. Even after the tremendous effort exercised by the City to repair the field before the start of a new season it never fails that midway through the season the field needs to be repaired again and again. Referees at times refuse to let games be played and on couple of occasions we have had players being severely injured due to the poor playing conditions of the field. Over the years the City was constantly informed and they did they're utmost best to repair the problem but somehow the band aid solutions only last for minimal amount of time and then it needs the City's attention again.

As we are extremely appreciative for the efforts Vaughan Council continues to make to meet the needs of the Vaughan Soccer Club members, we would like to offer our moral and financial support to perhaps convert this field to an artificial turf surface. Presently this undergoes continuous costly annual repairs to the City of Vaughan, should it be converted to an artificial turf the maintenance costs to the City of Vaughan would be nominal on a yearly basis thereafter. It would also ensure that this would provide a greater amount of usable time for the players therefore also benefiting the Vaughan Soccer Club.

The Vaughan Soccer Club Board Members have agreed to contribute funds to the City of Vaughan, of one hundred twenty thousand dollars (\$120,000.00) towards making the McNaughton Artificial Turf project a reality. The club's intentions are to provide the City of Vaughan the whole lump sum of \$120,000.00 for the McNaughton Field prior to the tender. If Council agrees to build an artificial turf field at this location. We at the Vaughan Soccer Club at a great inconvenience due to our lack of fields would also be willing not to use the field during this summer if this project gets the go ahead it deserves from City Council.

We truly believe this to be a viable and desirable project for all the stakeholders. The club is committed to present the funds to the City as an initiative that enhances services to our growing soccer community and provides a greater benefit to our youth which is of paramount interest to the Vaughan Soccer Club.

The Vaughan Soccer Club looks forward to working with the City on this exciting project.

Sincerely

Tony De Palma (President – Vaughan Soccer Club)

ATTACHMENT 'B'

McNaughton



**Rental Summary Report**

Printed: Feb 22 2008, 01:16 PM

User: class

Date from: March 1, 2007  
 Facility: McNaughton Senior PL SF  
 Facility Option: Facility  
 Facility: Yes

Date to: November 30, 2007  
 Complex: Maple Soccer Fields  
 Rental Status: Cancelled/Closed/Firm

	# Rentals	# Bookings	Attendance	Revenue	Extra Fee	Total
<b>Complex: Maple Soccer Fields</b>						
Facility: McNaughton Senior PL SF	5	195	0	\$7,611.53	\$0.00	\$7,611.53
Totals for Complex: Maple Soccer Fields	5	195	0	\$7,611.53	\$0.00	\$7,611.53
<b>Report Totals:</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>195</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>\$7,611.53</b>	<b>\$0.00</b>	<b>\$7,611.53</b>

Vaughan Grove



**Rental Summary Report**

Printed: Feb 22 2008, 01:15 PM

User: class

Date from: March 1, 2007  
 Facility: Vaughan Grove Artificial Turf PREM LIT  
 Facility Option: Facility  
 Facility: Yes

Date to: November 30, 2007  
 Complex: Woodbridge Soccer Fields  
 Rental Status: Cancelled/Closed/Firm

	# Rentals	# Bookings	Attendance	Revenue	Extra Fee	Total
<b>Complex: Woodbridge Soccer Fields</b>						
Facility: Vaughan Grove Artificial Turf PREM LIT	41	526	0	\$80,956.76	\$0.00	\$80,956.76
Totals for Complex: Woodbridge Soccer Fields	41	526	0	\$80,956.76	\$0.00	\$80,956.76
<b>Report Totals:</b>	<b>41</b>	<b>526</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>\$80,956.76</b>	<b>\$0.00</b>	<b>\$80,956.76</b>