

PROGRAM REVIEW APPROACH, FRAMEWORK AND TIMETABLE

Recommendation

The Commissioner of Finance/City Treasurer, in consultation with the City Manager and the Senior Management Team recommends:

That the Program Review framework, process and timetable be approved

Contribution to Sustainability

Sustainability by definition focuses on the ability to maintain an activity over an extended time horizon. A program review is intended to re-evaluate the City's programs and services and validate their alignment with the City's vision, obligations, and community interest. Through a series of program review "filters", the City will assess the appropriateness of programs. This will assist key stakeholders focusing on specific programs/services and determine if they are to be sustained or will be subject to further review. To ensure the sustainability of Vaughan's future, the results of the program review will be integrated with the corporate planning process.

Economic Impact

The initial steps associated with a program review will require significant staff time, in addition to regular work loads. Although this does not directly impact on department budgets, it may create a need for departments to reprioritize work efforts and initiatives.

The results and subsequent decisions stemming from the program review can have short and long term economic implications. Identified future implications will be discussed in a subsequent future report.

Communications Plan

Upon Council's adoption, a memo to staff will be provided through the Commissioner of Finance & City Treasurer's office.

Purpose

The purpose of this report is to obtain the Finance & Administration Committee/Council approval for the program review framework, process and timetable.

Background - Analysis and Options

Council Direction and the Inception of a Program Review

Like all municipalities, the City of Vaughan continues to be challenged with limited resources to meet service demands and the long term planning of the City. As demonstrated by the recent 2011 -2012 budget process, the task of prioritizing resources, allocating the marginal tax dollar, and sustaining operations is extremely important, but also very challenging. In this regard, Council approved the following Member's resolution, submitted by the Mayor, the Honourable Maurizio Bevilacqua:

"Whereas Vaughan residents work hard to earn a living; and where as the City of Vaughan wants to provide value for their property tax dollars; and where as residents deserve to know, that as

Council, we are providing leadership in the area of fiscal responsibility; it is therefore recommended that a Program Review framework be developed

To assist Council achieve this objective, the enclosed proposed program review approach, framework, and timeline were developed and are presented for Committee and Council consideration. Specific process details are provided in the following sections:

The Program Review Concept

A "Program Review" is a part of the overarching continuous improvement process and works in tandem with other City efforts aimed at prioritizing and focusing the use of limited resources. Examples include the corporate planning cycle, operational studies, suggestion program, etc.

The definition of a "Program Review" varies widely, but overall it is considered a broad based exercise to review service offerings or core service with the intent to clarify the appropriateness of programs and identify areas for improvement or further review.

Generally, the focus of a program review is at a high-level and serves to reflect on programs offered to residents and businesses, for the purpose of setting priorities and determining what services the City will provide in the future. This dialogue can begin once key decision makers have a clear picture of what programs are provided and for whom. From this point, decisions can be made and, if required, further effort can be applied on more specific areas of interest through service delivery reviews or operational reviews.

It is important to reiterate, the purpose of conducting a program review is to validate the City's program and service offerings. Although the opportunity for savings exists, the expectation for savings should be conservative, as some services are regulated and others may be operating close to minimum standards. Furthermore, should savings be realized, similar annual savings may not be sustainable, as opportunities will diminish as the City nears optimal program offerings. For these reasons it is best to utilize program reviews on a continuous basis thus assisting the City to adjust to its evolving needs.

Exercise Magnitude & Scope

The magnitude and effort required to undertake a city-wide program review is significant and should not be underestimated. Within the City of Vaughan, there are over 45 departments represented by 600 plus business units, all offering multiple services. The complexity of this structure is further complicated by varying systems, processes and department interconnectivity as it relates to program delivery.

What is a Program? As per the business dictionary definition, a "program" is a plan of action or grouping of activities aimed at accomplishing a clear business objective.

Unfortunately, the above interpretation is subjective and does not provide clear direction. To assist departments in performing a program review, the above definition has been augmented to reflect the following: ***"A program is a service offering or core function, consisting of activities to achieve a common business objective"***.

Scope: The program review will focus on all City departments, including the Library. Excluded from the program review is the Water & Waste Water Operation as this division prepares a separate budget supported by user fees, follows a separate approval process, and will undergo a separate review in order to align with provincial requirements.

Recognizing the diversity of services and mandates within the City, a Proposed Program Guide is provided as Attachment #1 outlining the draft scope of programs for each department to review. Overall, there are approximately 200 programs listed, all reflecting a relatively high level perspective. It should be noted, the Program Guide is intended as a reference point and

departments have the flexibility to augment the scope, keeping within the overall approach context, to better reflect the their programs.

Program Review Approach

Recognizing the above challenge and to assist the City achieve a successful and meaningful program review, a filter based approach is recommended, focusing on the appropriateness of programs.

What is a filter based approach? Recognizing that the time to complete this project is short, it is necessary to quickly focus in on the important larger based topics. To accomplish this we will use a multi – filter approach to quickly focus the City’s efforts. These are as follows:

- 1) Program Level Filter: Through a consistent approach, departments will review at a macro level the programs provided in the attached program guide.

Each program will be subjected to a series of filtering questions, which will quickly elevate the City’s understanding of the department programs and succinctly focus attention on areas of particular interest. A standardized questionnaire template with the filter questions described later in this report will be provided in July. This document, once completed, will form the basis for discussion at the next stage.

- 2) Director/Manager Workshop Session & SMT Review Filter:

- Directors and Managers will present their program and responses to the questions to a group of peers in a workshop format, who will critique the information, ensure it follows the approved framework and provide a level of consistency across the organization. It is anticipated that there will be the need for several facilitated workshop sessions to complete all programs.
- The peer group will complete a summary sheet for each program presented, which will provide the group’s consensus regarding “yes/no” answers, or rankings for each questions, as well as an overall recommendation for the next step for that particular program. This scoring template will be developed in July.
- SMT will review the consolidated program summary sheets and the proposed recommendations.

- 3) Council Directed Next Steps: In the fall, a staff report, presentation and the consolidated summary sheets with findings and recommendations will be provided to the Finance and Administration Committee for consideration. Members of Council will be able to quickly focus their attention to particular areas of interest. At this stage, Committee can provide direction on recommendations or add additional focused actions, for example: revise the program mandate, adjust services levels, restate service objectives, deliverables and/or measures, conduct operational reviews, consultants etc.

Program Test Framework

An important characteristic of the process is the reliance on Commissioners and Directors to perform a self-study within the framework provided.

The foundation of the test framework is based on the program review filtering questions provided by the Mayor during the 2011/2012 budget process. Where necessary, guiding questions were added to provide additional clarity.

After proceeding through the filtering questions for a program, the following answers to the statement "to what degree is the program right or suitable for the City to provide" will be developed, for example:

- Retain
- Phase out
- Upload
- User fee review
- Operational review
- Performance Measures required
- Further consideration required

The above "Framework" is further detailed below.

Program Description

- *Program name /description/overall objective/annual cost*

Program Review Questions approved by Council:

1. *Is the program still in the public interest?*

Guides: Surveys, public engagement measures, etc?
Does the program serve the community or an individual/group?

2. *Does this service fit with the public's priorities?*

Guides: Surveys, public engagement measures, etc.

3. *Is the delivery of the program a legitimate and necessary role of the City?*

Guides: Is the program legislated?
Is there a compliance, health & safety or control requirement?
Does the program provide access to basic needs?
Is the program a necessity or convenience oriented?
Are other appropriate City programs dependant?
o Delivery, subsidy, etc.

4. *Should the program be realigned with other levels of government?*

Guides: Is the program provided by other levels of government?
Is there a jurisdiction constraint?
Is there a need for municipal influence or control?
Would program service be improved?
Would synergies be achieved?

5. *Should it be delivered in partnership with the private or voluntary sector?*

Guides: Is the service also delivered by the private sector or the not-for-profit sector?
Is there any external interest in a program partnership?

6. Is the program affordable given our financial situation?

At this stage of the review process, this question may be difficult to answer. As the performance measures initiative is not yet underway, which would provide additional information to answer this question, a rating can be determined based on the following scale:

Scale of 1 to 5

- 5) Mandated municipal program
- 4) Between 3 and 5
- 3) Standard municipal program (typically provided at the local municipal level)
- 2) Between 1 and 3
- 1) A premium program infrequently provided at the local level

7. Can the program be redesigned for efficiency?

- Guides:
- What are the cost trends in the program's 2011 Budget business case?
 - What is the reason for the cost trend?
 - Are there fees for this program?
 - Is there a target level for fee subsidy and has it been achieved?
 - If there are severe budget constraints, would this program be a high or low level priority?
 - Are there program delivery alternatives?
 - Can technology be leveraged?
 - Can it be outsourced?
 - What is the approximate cost of the redesign?
 - Would the benefits of the redesign be short-term or long-term?

The above framework will provide the foundation for Directors, Managers and SMT to base their review, findings, report and recommendations. Areas of interest for further review will be highly visible in a summarized table.

At this point, Member's of Council will have a clearer picture of what services are provided, and for whom. Decisions can be made and, if required, further effort can be focused to more specific areas of interest through service delivery reviews, operational reviews, or other specific actions.

Sequence of Events & Timeframe

- Framework/process development July 6th, 2011
- Department information collection/submission July – August, 2011
- Director/Manager Workshop Session & SMT Review Filter: Sept. – October, 2011
- Committee/Council presentation & report Nov. – December, 2011
- Service delivery/operation review action plans TBD in 2012

Program Review Deliverables

Using a standardized format, a report/presentation package on the program review outcomes will be provided to Committee/Council. Each program will include a recommendation for a minimum of one of the following actions:

- Retain
- Phase out
- Upload
- User fee review
- Operational review
- Performance Measures required
- Further consideration required

Recommendations for the Future

The City is constantly evolving and programs should be reviewed on a regular basis to ensure alignment with the City's vision, obligations and community needs. After the City completes this year's review of all department programs, it is recommended the review continue on a 3-5 year rotating cycle. This will alleviate the compressed time commitment, maintain continuous improvement efforts, and foster communication and collaboration. This is very typical among those who undertake a program review. In addition, this methodology should be applied when considering any requests for new or enhanced services. This approach is consistent with the prioritized strategic theme "Ensure a High Performing Organization", the strategic initiatives supporting this theme will begin upon completion of the 2011 Program Review:

- Further evolve performance indicators
- Operational/Business reviews

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020 / Strategic Plan

The report is consistent with the priority initiatives set by Council.

Regional Implications

Not applicable at this point in the program review.

Conclusion

A "Program Review" is a part of an overarching continuous improvement process and works in tandem with other City efforts aimed at prioritizing and focusing the use of limited resources. The intent of a program review is to re-evaluate the City's programs and services and validate their alignment with the City's vision, obligations, and community interest. Through the recommended program review approach and framework, the City will determine the appropriateness of its programs and will assist in determining if programs are to be sustained or subject to further review.

Attachments

Attachment #1 – Department Program Guide

Report prepared by:

Barbara Cribbett, CMA
Commissioner of Finance/City Treasurer
Ext. 8475

John Henry, CMA
Director of Budgeting and Financial Planning
Ext. 8348

Respectfully submitted,

Barbara Cribbett, CMA
Commissioner of Finance/City Treasurer

Attachment #1: Proposed City Program Guide

Department	Division	Program						
City Manager								
Strategic Planning		Strategic Planning						
Environmental Sustainability		Environmental Sustainability						
Corporate Policy		Corporate Policy						
Operational Audit		Operational Audit						
Emergency Planning		Develop Plans and Procedures/Risk Assessment Emergency Exercises Training, Awareness and Education						
Fire and Rescue Services	Fire & Rescue Services-Admin.	Fire & Rescue Services-Admin.						
	Fire Communication	Dispatch						
	Fire Training	Fire Training						
	Fire Emergency Medical	Defibrillator Program						
	Fire Mechanical	Vaughan Vehicles R&M Other municipalities' vehicles R&M Warranty repair for third parties						
	Fire Prevention	Inspection, Investigation, Enforcement Prevention and Safety Programs						
	Fire Operations	Fire response Medical Emergencies Technical Rescue Hazard Material & CBRN						
Integrity Commissioner								
Integrity Commissioner		Office- Integrity Commissioner						
Comm. of Community Services								
Buildings and Facilities		Building Construction Cafeteria Services Historical Buildings Community Centres Municipal buildings Parks Facilities Fire Stations Library City Playhouse Other (Radio Tower, Powerstream, etc)						
		<table border="1"> <tr> <td>HVAC</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Electrical</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Plumbing</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Security</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Waste</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Carpenter</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Cleaning</td> </tr> </table>	HVAC	Electrical	Plumbing	Security	Waste	Carpenter
HVAC								
Electrical								
Plumbing								
Security								
Waste								
Carpenter								
Cleaning								
Commty. Grants & Advisory Comm		Communities in Bloom Gallanough Resource Library Safe City Committee Commty Equity & Diversity Comm Vaughan Youth Cabinet Accessibility Advisory Cttee The Seniors Assoc. of Vaughan Arts Advisory Committee Public Art Advisory Committee Police Community Liaison Comm. Non-Profit Housing						
Cultural Services		Vaughan Cult. Interpretive Ctr Arts Heritage Vaughan						
	Special Events	Doors Open Vaughan Canada Day Concerts in the Park Mayor's Events Official Openings/Ceremonies Children's Holiday Functions Volunteer Recognition Awards Winterfest						
Fleet Management		Repairs and Maintenance Fuel Pumps						

Attachment #1: Proposed City Program Guide

Department	Division	Program
Parks Design, Construct. & Mtc		Parks - Administration Horticulture Capital Proj./Cemetery
	Forestry	Storm Water Mgmt Ponds Boulevard Maintenance Tree Maintenance Urban Reforestation Woodlot Management Storm Clean-up Asian Longhorn Beetle
	Operations - Sports Fields/Courts	Baseball Soccer Tennis Bocce Skateparks Rinks Cricket Basketball
	Operations - Non Sports Fields/Courts	Playgrounds Pools Water Parks Path/Sidewalk Snow Clearing Trails/Paths Open Spaces (e.g. Regional, Neighbourhood, Parkettes)
Parks Development		Plans and Studies Capital Acquisition
Recreation		Admin and Planning (incl. cash collections) Camp programs YRT Advertising Concessions Permits Services in kind City Playhouse
	General Programs	Preschool Baby sitting/ Before & After School Youth outreach Adult Seniors
	Aquatics	Instructional (Private, Group) Open Access (e.g. free swim) Recreational Programs (e.g. Aquafit)
	Fitness Centres	General Fitness Personal Training
	Ice Rinks	Hockey Sports Village (Hockey Subsidy) Figure Skating Public Skate
Comm. of Planning		
Building Standards		OBC Application Review and Inspection Non-OBC Application Review (signs, swimming pool, grading, fill) Zoning Clearance and Responses Client Letters and Responses Title Restriction Clearance
Development Planning		Application Examination and Approval OMB Hearings GIS Urban Design and Landscape Architecture
Policy Planning		Official Plan Policy Review and Development Secondary Plans/Local Studies Specialized Projects OMB Appeals

Attachment #1: Proposed City Program Guide

Department	Division	Program
Comm. of Engineering & PWs		
Develop&Transport Engineering		Development Engineering Development Inspections and Lot Grading Transportation Engineering Engineering Planning Studies (Development Infrastructure)
Engineering Services		Linear Infrastructure Renewal Mgmt Traffic Studies (Existing) Utilities Coordination Pavement Markings
Public Works - Operations	Roads Maintenance	Linear Infrastructure Repairs Linear Infrastructure PM Roads Sign Maintenance Road Patrol Road Sweeping Yard Operations Graffiti Removal
	Waste Management	Administration, Promotion, Education Garbage Leaf/Yard Waste Blue Box Green Bin Backyard Composter Appliance Collection
	Winter Control	Road Snow Clearing Windrow Snow Clearing Ice and Snow Removal Salting and Sanding Snow fencing Yard Operations
Comm. of ETD & Corp. Commun		
Access Vaughan		Information Desk General Phone Inquiries City Promotion
Corporate Communications		Media Relations Communications Support (Internal, External, Emergency) Marketing and Promotion City Website/Page Content Management
Economic and Business Develop.		Foreign business development Vaughan Business Enterprises - Small Business Development Economic Cluster Development Employment Zone Development (e.g VES, VMC) Business Investment and Attraction City Branding and Marketing
Information & Technology Mgmt.		IT and Telecommunications Network Infrastructure Management Corporate Systems (GIS, JDE, Sharepoint etc.) Legacy Systems (Questica, AMANDA, Class etc.) Computer, Peripheral and Telephony Management Business Solutions Helpdesk

Attachment #1: Proposed City Program Guide

Department	Division	Program
Comm. of Finance & Corp. Serv.		
Accounting and Financial Services		Financial Statements General Accounting Accounts Payable Accounts Receivable Payroll Services
	Property Tax	Assessment and Billing Tax Collections Appeals
Budgeting & Planning		Annual operating budget Long Range financial Planning Program Costing & Special Projects
Purchasing Services		Contract Services Procurement of goods
Reserves & Investments		Capital budget Reserves and trusts Letter of Credit & Securities Development Charge administration Managing Investment Portfolio
Comm. of Legal & Admin. Serv.		
City Clerk		City Secretariat services Records Management Access & Privacy FOI Mailroom/Print Shop Courier Services Licensing & Permits Committee of Adjustment/Development Elections Insurance & Risk Management Council Corporate
	Archival Services	Records Local Artifacts
Enforcement Services		By-law enforcement - Property Standards By-law enforcement - Zoning By-law enforcement - General Licensing Enforcement Parking and Sign control Event Security Penalty Notice, First Attendance and Collection Park and Community Patrol Animal Services
Human Resources		Recruitment Employee/Labour Relations Compensation and Benefits Health and Safety Learning and Development Crossing Guards
Legal Services		Legal Advice OMB Hearings Legal Actions Review Draft Agreements
	Real Estate	Acquisitions Cash in Lieu Leases Appraisals
Library Board		
Vaughan Libraries		To Provide Places (To rent, study, gather) Provide Research Assistance Internet/Computer Access Core Programs Other Programs and Events
	Collections	Recreational Reading Reference Periodicals Music Movies