

**NON-UNION PART-TIME COMPENSATION**

**Recommendation**

The Commissioner of Legal & Administrative Services & City Solicitor and the Director of Human Resources recommend that this report be received for information and discussion.

**Contribution to Sustainability**

The ongoing review of compensation and the City's pay policy ensures that the City will sustain its operations into the future.

**Economic Impact**

Any economic impact will depend on what, if any action Council directs with respect to changes to pay rates for various classifications. The 2012 draft operating budget does not reflect any increase.

**Communications Plan**

Any adjustments that are made to any classifications will be communicated to the employees affected by such adjustments.

**Purpose**

This report provides a comprehensive review of the pay policies and practices as they relate to the City's non-union part-time classifications including Council Part-time Administrative Assistants and provides comparative information from other municipalities with regard to non-union part-time classifications and pay policies.

**Background - Analysis and Options**

**Background:**

At a Finance and Administration Committee meeting on September 19, 2011 staff were directed to bring back a report prior to December 31, 2011 with regard to compensation rates for Council Administrative Assistants. The recommendations of Report 16, Item 5 stated:

**The Finance and Administration Committee recommends that the salary of Council's part-time occasional assistants be reviewed by Human Resources in light of the fact that there has been no increase in their pay rate in approximately sixteen years, and that a new benchmarked pay rate be recommended in a report to Council, for consideration and action no later than December 31, 2011.**

In addition, comments were made by Council members asking that the report address the following;

- i) information about other classifications that had not had an adjustment for sixteen years;
- ii) information as to why this classification is not paid at the same rate as the Citizen Service representatives in Access Vaughan given the feeling that they do the same job; and
- iii) The City of Toronto model as it applies to staffing and budgeting for staffing in Council offices

### Pay Policy/Compensation:

In 2002, Council established a pay policy that was to be applied to the full-time non-union administrative staff covered under the Management By-law. The pay policy established a pay line at the 50<sup>th</sup> percentile based on the comparators set by Council in 2002. The comparators set by Council for purposes of salary survey's and establishing the pay line include: Mississauga, Brampton, Oakville, Richmond Hill, Markham and the Region of York. As part of the Council approved pay policy staff was directed to conduct annual salary surveys with the comparators to ensure that the City's salary ranges were consistent with the pay policy. A proper comparison can only be made if there is job match across at least three of the six comparator municipalities.

In 2008, Council adopted this same approach as the pay policy for the part-time within the organization. Part-time non-union positions include those in the Recreation Department, Crossing Guards, Facility Operators, Administrative Assistants in the Council offices, etc. Therefore, in keeping with the Council approved policy a salary survey is conducted annually using the City's established comparator municipalities and utilizing the same process for comparison as is utilized for full-time non-union management and administrative positions.

### Council Administrative Assistants and Pre-school Instructors

As a result of the annual salary surveys some classifications have received adjustments to their pay range so that it is consistent with the 50<sup>th</sup> percentile pay policy. There are a number of jobs that based on the pay policy and annually conducted salary surveys, have not been identified for increases. The following jobs include those that have not had an increase prior to and as a result of the annual salary survey. In some cases, the rate has not been adjusted since 1990:

Kid's Club Program Leader	Kid's Club Site Supervisor
Learn to Skate Assistant	Learn to Skate Head Instructor
Skate Cashier	Shinny Hockey Attendant
Skate Patrol	Skate Patrol (Outdoors)
Skate Captain	Sport Attendant (Youth Drop-in Staff)
General Sport Assistant	General Sport Head Instructor
Specialty Sport Assistant	Specialty Sport Head Instructor
Sport Pro	Dance Instructor
Arts Instructor, Adults	Music Professional
Specialty Dance Instructor	Babysitting Staff
Program Assistant	Children & Youth Program Instructor
Preschool Program Instructor	Coop Playschool Assistant
Special Needs Program Assistant	Fitness Counsellor
Indoor Cycling Instructor	Group Fitness Instructor
Personal Trainer	

However, through the application of the City's pay policy to this group of jobs, the following jobs have had an adjustment:

In addition, some jobs have received adjustments to comply with the minimum standards outlined by the *Employment Standards Act*.

Camp Counsellor	Camp Specialist
Assistant Director	Camp Director
Camp Coordinator	Assistant Program Instructor
Head Program Leader (N/I)	Site Supervisor
Instructor III	Lifeguard
Head Lifeguard	Instructor I
Instructor II	Instructor III

In addition, some jobs have received adjustments to comply with the minimum standards outlined by the *Employment Standards Act*.

Some staff including the Pre-school and Co-Op Pre-school Instructors, the Council Part-time Administrative Assistants, and Fitness Centre staff have expressed concerns with the fact that their pay rate has not been adjusted in many years. Incumbents in these classifications are seeking what constitutes a pay increase outside of the City's established pay policies.

Arguments have been made that the pay rates should be adjusted because the incumbents are valued, long-term employees who perform their jobs well. It should be noted that in recent years, the City adjusted its recognition policies to recognize the long service of part-time non-union employees to address this concern.

It is also important to note that the City's pay policy sets pay rates based on the duties and responsibilities of the classifications and not based on the individual that is doing the work.

Pre-School Instructors and Council Part-time Administrative Assistants, have pointed to the pay rates for similar jobs in the City of Toronto. The City of Toronto is not a comparator for the City of Vaughan therefore, those rates are not included for consideration when conducted that annual salary survey.

#### Comparison to Access Vaughan

The duties and job requirements of the Part-time Council Administrative Assistants was compared to the work of the part-time Access Vaughan representatives.

A review of the qualifications required and duties for each of these positions including the recruitment and training processes, the knowledge required and the duties and responsibilities of each position it is clear that the jobs are significantly different thereby supporting a difference in pay.

The process of recruitment, selection and training for part-time Citizen Service Representatives (CSR) is quite substantial. Candidates are required to have a Community College diploma along with a minimum of 2 years of call centre experience. The process includes customer service call testing whereby candidates are tested on the following competencies: customer focus, data entry skills, interpersonal skills, learning potential, multi-tasking, ownership, processing speed, quality focus, reading and comprehension, wpm. The candidate must pass the minimum weighted average in each competency and also achieve an overall minimum score. Those who pass are then required to participate in structured interviews with a panel who objectively consider the candidates responses and determine if they are to move forward in the process. A minimum of three reference checks are completed for each candidate who is being considered for a CSR position.

Once a CSR candidate is successful and is hired to the City they are then scheduled for and must pass a structured six week training program about the City, the services it provides and the following:

- York Region Services, Federal Services, Provincial Services, PowerStream
- Detailed call types for integrated departments such as: Parks & Forestry Operation, Waste, Tax, Recreation & Culture, Animal Services and Enforcement
- KT - Knowledge Tool, CTS - JD Edwards, V-Tax, TextNet, UbiDuo
- Call Type Tracker, Information Desk Procedures, Event Registration
- Escalation Process
- Customer Service and Call Handling

During the training period there are tests, role play and quizzes to ensure that knowledge transfer has occurred and that there is an acceptable level of understanding of each module introduced.

After the conclusion of the training program, if the candidate continues to be successful, they are then paired up with an experienced CSR for a minimum period of two weeks to watch and review how calls are addressed at the City of Vaughan. When the eight weeks of training have been concluded, and the candidate remains successful, they are then allowed to answer the calls and respond to the public. Trainees are monitored and measured both quantitatively and qualitatively. All calls are recorded, reviewed by management and regular coaching and counselling are provided on a monthly basis throughout their employment with Access Vaughan. In addition, call statistics are reviewed and measured on a daily, weekly and monthly basis with each CSR. During the recruitment and selection process and throughout the probationary period, the candidates must be successful throughout

With regard to part-time temporary Council Administrative Assistants, Human Resources staff are not involved in the recruitment or selection of the candidates. There are no set minimum job requirements that a candidate must meet in order to be placed into the position. To staff's knowledge there is no testing or objective panel interviews conducted, nor are references checked for the successful candidates. The duties and responsibilities of the position are general, administrative and supportive to the Executive Assistant. They do not do the full duties and responsibilities of the Executive Assistant classification, unless they are in the position for more than a month. As a result, the duties and responsibilities are significantly different and there is no formal training program provided to these candidates.

CSR's are hired to provide service 24 hours per week. They are scheduled for these 24 hours based on operational needs and do not have an ability to accept or decline shifts that are assigned. In reviewing the utilization of part-time temporary Council Administrative Assistants during the current term of Council, there have been 20 temporary part-time Council Administrative Assistants employed in the various Council offices. These Assistants provided service from a low average of 1 hour a week to a maximum average of 27 hours per week with a weekly average of 10 hours. While the temporary part-time Council Administrative Assistants provide a significant support to the Councillor's office, the support is directly related to the Councillor's office and not provided on a corporate basis.

#### City of Toronto

While the City of Toronto is not a comparator municipality, staff did contact staff of the City of Toronto to better understand how support is provided to Councillors in the City of Toronto. Staff were advised that there are five administrative jobs that a Councillor can hire to support their offices. Each of these administrative jobs has a salary range within which the Councillor can choose to pay the employee, and that the total salary costs must be within their budget.

Each Councillor in the City of Toronto has a staffing budget of approximately \$212,000. This amount is consistent with the total annual salary and benefits of one Executive Assistant, one Administrative Assistant and one Constituency Assistant. The Councillor has the discretion to hire full-time or part-time within the following positions and ranges to the maximum budget allocation. As you can see, all positions are administrative in nature.

<b>Position</b>	<b>Minimum of Range</b>	<b>Maximum of Range</b>
Executive Assistant	\$42,387.80	\$79,570.40
Constituency Assistant	\$34,871.20	\$65,938.60
Admin. Assistant 2	\$34,871.20	\$65,938.60
Admin. Assistant 1	\$26,663.00	\$50,068.20
Councillors Aide	\$24,879.40	

In Vaughan each member of Council has a budget which is calculated based on the population in the ward and ranges from \$110,548 to \$163,298.

Vaughan Local and Regional Councillors have administrative support for their offices as follows:

<b>Position</b>	<b>Minimum of Range</b>	<b>Maximum of Range</b>	<b>Budget</b>
Executive Assistant	\$70,851	\$84,346	Clerks
PT Council Admin working with EA	\$15 per hour (\$27,300 annual FTE)		Council members budget
PT Council Admin – no EA available	\$17 per hour (\$30,940 annual FTE)		Clerks if due to absence of EA
PT Council Admin – filling in for EA in excess of 1 month	\$38.93 per hour (\$70,851 annual FTE)		Clerks

While the support staff for the Council members is administrative in nature, the organization does provide specific support in a variety of corporate areas such as information technology, human resources, corporate communications, purchasing and finance to members of council as required.

#### Survey of Municipalities

Staff conducted a survey of many Ontario municipalities including the large municipalities, those in York Region and those in southern Ontario to determine the level of support of the various Council offices as well as the salary ranges that were paid to the employees providing the support. A copy of the information is attached on Attachment #1. Of the 22 municipalities that responded to the survey, many do not provide direct council support staff to each individual Councillor. General support is provided either through the Mayor's office or through the CAO or Clerk's office and is shared amongst all Councillors.

Brampton and Mississauga provide direct full-time support directly to Council members. Brampton provides one Administrative Assistant for each Councillor, while Mississauga provides one Executive Assistant and one Administrative Assistant. Neither municipality provides for additional part-time temporary staff to support the work of the Councillor's office. Brampton uses the corporate temporary pool to provide administrative assistance during vacation or extended absences. As Mississauga has two positions, those positions are required to schedule absences to ensure that there is always someone in the office for support.

The Town of Markham provides full-time support for its Regional Councillors and a half time administrative support person for each of its Local Councillors. There is no money budgeted to address additional workload. Richmond Hill provides four Administrative Assistants. Each Administrative Assistant supports two Councillors and the Assistants provide back up support for each other.

The Town of Oakville does not provide direct support for its Councillors except through a full and part-time receptionist who provide front office services to the CAO/Mayor and Council offices.

## Options and Implications

Options for increasing the salary of the Council Part-time Administrative Assistants are considered below. Given the City's pay policy set by Council the following options may be perceived as a means of getting around the policy and may have unintended implications which are addressed below.

### Option 1

Maintain the pay rate for the part-time non-union Council Administrative Assistant classification in accordance with the Council approved pay policy for non-union part-time staff established in 2008.

### Option 2

Place the job at the lowest level of the non-union administrative salary schedule which as of July 1, 2011 equates to \$24.17 (\$43,989 annual FTE) per hour. This rate would be adjusted each time that the salary schedule was adjusted by Council.

Since this is the only administrative job in the part-time non-union group, this change could be implemented with a rationale for why the other classifications are not changing. If the part-time Council Administrative Assistant replaced the Executive Assistant for more than a month, they would be paid at the start rate for the Executive Assistant position which would then be paid out of the Clerk's budget.

The anticipated annual cost of this rate would be \$76,290 assuming a consistent number of hours from year to year.

### Option 3

Since no municipal comparators have a job match for the classification part-time temporary Council Administrative Assistants, and given that it is the only administrative position within the non-union part-time group, it may be an option to remove or exempt the classification from the City's pay policy and simply apply an annual adjustment to the position equivalent to annual adjustments provided to other administrative classifications within the City.

The financial impact of increasing the pay rate by 3% (2012 increase) from \$15 per hour to \$15.45 per hour (\$28,199 annual FTE) and from \$17 per hour to \$17.51 per hour (\$31,868 annual FTE) based on existing number of hours worked calculated on an annual basis is approximately \$3800 annually.

## Implications

Making adjustments to salary rates/ranges outside of the pay policy has implications across other classifications. Employees in other classifications may perceive this as a precedent for other adjustments outside of policy if they do not qualify for an increase under the salary survey.

Providing an increase of 3% to all non-union part-time classifications would increase the City's budget by \$183,072 annually assuming consistent hours from year to year. In Recreation, the cost is \$149,492. Recreation strives to achieve a 95% cost recovery model and any increases to the pay rates would require a corresponding increase to the user fees to maintain this goal.

### **Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan**

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council specifically valuing and encouraging a highly motivated workforce and the necessary resources have not been allocated.

### **Regional Implications**

None

### **Conclusion**

This report provides a review of Vaughan's pay policies as well as provides a benchmarking of salaries of Council support staff in comparator municipalities as well as Toronto and other Ontario Municipalities. In addition, it provides the information requested by Councillors at the Finance and Administration Committee. While there are options presented for discussion it is important to note that any adjustments to Council Part-time Administrative Assistant salaries would be outside of the City's pay policy and consideration must be given to the implications of such a decision.

### **Attachments**

1. Support Positions Across Municipalities

### **Report prepared by:**

Janet Ashfield  
Director of Human Resources

Respectfully submitted,

Janice Atwood-Petkovski  
Commissioner of Legal & Administrative  
Services & City Solicitor

Janet Ashfield  
Director of Human Resources

SUPPORT POSITIONS ACROSS MUNICIPALITIES

Attachment #1

Municipality	# of Members of Council	Total FTE in Council Offices	FTE per Councillor	Job Rate	FTE per Reg Coun	Job Rate	Temporary pt workload relief support
<b>Comparators</b>							
Vaughan	9	16.5	EA	\$ 84,346.00	EA	\$ 84,346.00	Part-time support to assist with workload Paid \$15/\$17 per hour
Brampton	10		AA	\$ 69,100.00	AA	\$ 69,100.00	No part-time support
Mississauga	12	26	EA	\$ 80,812.00	EA	\$ 80,812.00	No part-time support
			AA	\$ 62,417.00	AA	\$ 62,417.00	
Markham	12	10	0.5 AA	\$ 54,410.00	AA	\$ 54,412.00	No part-time support
Richmond Hill	9	6	0.5 AA	\$ 59,400.00	0.5 AA	\$ 59,400.00	PT Assistance hired in Clerk's department and provided to support Mayor and Councillor events - Pd at \$19/hour
Oakville	13	1.5	0		0		1.5 FTE supports CAO/Mayor and Council Offices
<b>Additional</b>							
Toronto	45	152	3	See report	0		Assistance provided through Committee Coordinators in Clerks
Thunder Bay	13	0	0		0		
Aurora	9	0	0		0	\$ 72,454.00	
King	7	0	0		0	\$ 60,182.00	
Witchurch-Stouffville	7	1	0		0	\$ 60,136.00	1FTE provides support to all Council members
Newmarket	7	1	0		0	\$ 67,395.00	1 FTE provides support to all Councillors
Kingston	13	0	0		0		No support provided
Oshawa	11	2	0		0	\$ 70,500.00	2 FTE provide support to all Council members (1 EA and 1 AA)
Ajax	7	1	0		0	\$ 65,811.00	1 FTE provides support to the Mayor and Council
Caledon	9	2	0		0	\$ 63,079.00	8 Councillors, CAO and Communication Manager supported by one EA with job rate of \$69,791. Mayor has own EA
Whitby	9	3	0		0		3 Positions in Mayor's office support Councillors as well
BWG	9	1	0		0	\$ 64,288.00	1 FTE provides support to CAO and Council
Guelph	13	0	0		0		Provide no support
St. Catharines	13	2.5	0		0		Provide no support to Councillors
Clarington	7	2	0		0	\$ 70,227.00	1 AA provides assistance to all Council members
Milton	11	2	0		0		2 FTE shared with CAO and Mayor. No support for Councillors
Burlington	7	8	0		0	\$ 69,800.00	5 FTE shared amongst 6 members of council