

CITY OF VAUGHAN
REPORT NO. 8 OF THE
HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE

*For consideration by the Committee of the Whole
of the City of Vaughan
on December 6, 2011*

The Heritage Vaughan Committee met at 7:04 p.m., on October 12, 2011.

Present: John Mifsud, Chair
 Robert Stitt
 Robert M. Brown
 Roger Dickinson
 Lucy Di Pietro
 Richard Hahn
 Tony Marziliano
 Gianni Mignardi
 Nick Pacione
 Fadia Pahlawan
 Christine Radewych
 Regional Councillor Deb Schulte
 Rajbir Singh
 Claudio Travierso

Also Present: Lauren Archer, Cultural Heritage Co-ordinator
 Cecilia Nin Hernandez, Cultural Heritage Co-ordinator

The following items were dealt with:

1. **197 WOODBRIDGE STREET, WOODBRIDGE DOCTORS MCLEAN CARRIAGE HOUSE, REQUEST FOR DEMOLITION OF CONTRIBUTING BUILDING WITHIN THE WOODBRIDGE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT**

Owner: Joseph Ieradi

Heritage Vaughan advises that they approved the following recommendation:

That this application be deferred, as requested by Mr. Joseph Ieradi.

Recommendation

Cultural Services recommends:

1. That Heritage Vaughan considers the request for demolition of Doctors McLean Carriage House located at 197 Woodbridge Ave. and the information provided in this report.

**REPORT NO. 8 OF HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 6, 2011**

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council in the Green Directions, Vaughan, Community Sustainability Environmental Master Plan, Goal 4, Objective 4.1:

- To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage.

Economic Impact

None

Communications Plan

All agenda items and minutes relating to Heritage Vaughan committee meetings are circulated to relevant City departments, applicants and their representatives.

Purpose

To review the documentation provided for the Carriage House structure located at 197 Woodbridge Ave. and consider the information provided by the owner and the demolition of the subject structure. This item was deferred at the September 2011 meeting to the October 2011 meeting at the request of the owner.

Background - Analysis and Options

1.0 Heritage Status

1.1 The subject property at located at 197 Woodbridge Avenue is designated part V of the Ontario Heritage Act, as it is part of the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District.

1.2 The property is identified as a Contributing building in the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Inventory.

1.3 The subject property is also listed in the City's *Register of Buildings of Architectural and Historical Value*, as per Part IV, Section 27 of the Ontario Heritage Act.

1.4 The subject structure is a Victorian Carriage House style, built circa 1893, by Dr. Peter Douglas McLean in 1893, a local doctor and elected Member of Parliament in 1907. Two generations of McLean doctors served the community after their father - Dr. Garnet Douglas and Dr. Charles McLean.

1.5 Doctors McLean District Park in Woodbridge was named in honour of their service to the community.

1.6 Peter McLean owned the first automobile. In Woodbridge and in 1910 the structure was converted for use as an automobile garage.

1.7 Summary of architectural character defining elements:

- 1.7.1 rough timber post and beam structure, as confirmed in the Engineer's letter.
- 1.7.2 East elevation: Gabled roof with one central gothic gable with rectangular masonry opening for wood louvered vent.
- 1.7.3 two door urban barn/garage at gable end. Depressed elliptical arch of front left door bricked in when wood lintels installed for two (single) swinging garage doors for automobile c. 1910.
- 1.7.4 painted rough sawn lintels on north elevation
- 1.7.5 swing door (vertical paneling) on west side
- 1.7.6 Gothic central gable

**REPORT NO. 8 OF HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 6, 2011**

- 1.7.7 Window openings with wood louvered shutters
- 1.7.8 Rectangular Window opening
- 1.7.9 clad in red brick with segmental and depressed elliptical brick arches (1893)
- 1.7.10 wood vertical board hinged hay loft access doors on north elevation and on west elevation.

2.0 Current Proposal

The current owner of the property has requested the demolition of the structure and has submitted a letter from an engineer recommending the demolition of the structure (attached in this report).

3.0 Analysis

The engineer's letter explains the structure's poor condition. The issues identified in the letter include the shifting of the foundation on the east side and resulting danger of buckling of the east foundation wall and the brick veneer above it. Other related damage is described in the letter which is attached to this report. It states that to remedy the issues, reconstruction of the foundation and timber structure as well as the east and west wall's brick veneer will be necessary. The letter concludes that considering the type of building, it would not constitute a cost effective approach to remedy the issues found and it recommends the demolition of the structure.

With permission of the owner staff visited the site to document the exterior. The structure was photographed from the outside, and the issues described in the letter can be observed. Cultural Services can provide a visual confirmation of evidence of possible issues affecting a structure to be noted for evaluation by a licensed structural engineer; however staff does not provide structural integrity evaluations of buildings as this falls outside of staff's scope. Please see photos attached.

Cultural Services also obtained historical information on the structure; please refer to section 1.0 of this report. A full Built Heritage Evaluation was not possible due to lack of access to the interior of the structure. However, it is clear that the building has historical value due to its association with the property's original owners which is meaningful to the community. Also, it has architectural value in it being the only urban barn/garage type building of its architectural, construction type and vintage in our City's Inventory. Please refer to Character Defining elements noted above.

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

Reference specific initiative report relates to:

In consideration of the strategic priorities related to Vaughan Vision 2020, the report will provide:

- STRATEGIC GOAL:
Service Excellence - Providing service excellence to citizens.
- STRATEGIC OBJECTIVES:
Preserve our heritage and support diversity, arts and culture.

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council and the necessary resources have been allocated and approved.

**REPORT NO. 8 OF HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 6, 2011**

Regional Implications

None

Conclusion

The subject heritage building is identified as having significant architectural and historical value, and is also significant its contribution to the heritage character of the Woodbridge Ave. streetscape and building stock. The demolition of contributing buildings within the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District is not recommended. Retention, preservation and restoration of the subject Carriage House is recommended.

However, the subject structure has also been identified as being in poor structural condition and that correcting the issues would be monetarily costly.

Report prepared by:

Lauren Archer
Cultural Heritage Coordinator
Recreation and Culture Department

Cecilia Nin Hernandez
Cultural Heritage Coordinator
Recreation and Culture Department

Angela Palermo
Manager of Cultural Services
Recreation and Culture Department

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

2. 695 NASHVILLE ROAD, HERITAGE REVIEW APPLICATION FOR A REVISED HERITAGE PERMIT FOR PROPERTY WITHIN THE KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT

Heritage Vaughan advises that they approved the following recommendation:

1. That this matter be deferred and that the applicant be invited to attend a future meeting to address the concerns raised by Heritage Vaughan members;
2. That staff provide a comprehensive report detailing the background of this and previous applications, identifying any alterations made to the property without the approval of Heritage Vaughan, and any violations that currently exist; and
3. That the report also address the concerns raised by Heritage Vaughan with respect to enforcement and possible penalties for non-compliance to the Heritage Act.

Recommendation

Cultural Services recommends:

1. That the Heritage Vaughan Committee consider the subject application for a revised heritage permit to include the as-built arched window.

**REPORT NO. 8 OF HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 6, 2011**

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council in the Green Directions, Vaughan, Community Sustainability Environmental Master Plan, Goal 4, Objective 4.1:

- To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage.

Economic Impact

None

Communications Plan

All agenda items and minutes relating to Heritage Vaughan committee meetings are circulated to relevant City departments, applicants and their representatives.

Purpose

To review the as-built condition of the subject second storey addition to the existing building at 695 Nashville Rd. and consider an amended Heritage Permit to reflect changes made to the design during the construction of the addition by the applicant.

Background - Analysis and Options

1.0 Background

- 1.1 The subject property is located within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District and is, therefore, designated under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act.
- 1.2 All proposed changes to the property (including exterior alterations, additions or demolition) require, in addition to all other City approvals, the approval of a Heritage Permit application in accordance with the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan.
- 1.3 The subject building was constructed in the 1960s in the Ranch Bungalow architectural style, which is considered a Non-heritage architectural style in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Guidelines.
- 1.4 The Heritage Vaughan Committee first reviewed the plans and elevation drawings for a Heritage Permit Application for the proposed addition and renovation of the subject property at their August 21, 2006 meeting.

2.0 Analysis

- 2.1 The applicant originally proposed to replace the single-storey garage on the west side of the house with a two-storey addition with a front gable roof.
- 2.2 Cultural Services staff worked with the applicant to ensure that the proposal is sympathetic to the heritage character of the property and streetscape and that it is in keeping with the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Design Guidelines.
- 2.3 The Heritage Vaughan Committee approved the elevations, as they appear in the Attachments Section of the following report at the August 21, 2006 meeting of Heritage Vaughan.
- 2.4 The applicant did not build as per the drawings approved, instead, the applicant build an arched window in the front gable of the second storey addition.

**REPORT NO. 8 OF HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 6, 2011**

2.5 This discrepancy was documented by Cultural Services staff, and in May 16, 2007 the Heritage Vaughan Committee made the following recommendation:

Heritage Vaughan recommends:

That, Heritage Vaughan not approve the owner's proposal to approve a revision to Heritage Permit 2006-018 that would allow an arched front window on the house at 695 Nashville Road, and;

That, Heritage Vaughan direct the owner to devise a plan to return the front façade and window design to a state that is in keeping with the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Design Guidelines which then may be approved by Cultural Services staff as a revised version of Heritage Permit 2006-018.

2.6 Cultural Services staff had discussed with the applicant at the time the arched window was discussed, as well as the importance of remaining sympathetic to the original heritage character of the property and streetscape and maintain a design which is in keeping with the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Design Guidelines.

2.7 The applicant was made aware that the use of an arched window is not in keeping with the original heritage character of a 1960s Ranch Bungalow style home during the pre-consultation process, and was aware that this style of window was not considered in keeping with the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District guidelines.

2.8 The applicant did not do as recommended. As such, the window remains as built. The applicant received notice from the Building Standards department that the addition was not completed as proposed.

2.9 The applicant argues that there are several similar arched windows visible on Nashville Road, and that windows of this style are typical within the district.

2.10 The subject Building Permit application is considered Open, and has not been closed by the Building department for reasons that include this discrepancy between the submitted drawings and the as-built condition.

2.11 No order to comply has been issued by the Building department to the applicant to date.

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

Reference specific initiative report relates to:

In consideration of the strategic priorities related to Vaughan Vision 2020, the report will provide:

- STRATEGIC GOAL:
Service Excellence - Providing service excellence to citizens.

- STRATEGIC OBJECTIVES:
Preserve our heritage and support diversity, arts and culture.

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council and the necessary resources have been allocated and approved.

Regional Implications

None

**REPORT NO. 8 OF HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 6, 2011**

Conclusion

The subject applicant has already requested an amendment to the subject application, which was reviewed with the proposed addition was still under construction, and the applicant was informed that the window was not appropriate on several occasions. Considering the history of the subject application, it is apparent that the applicant has chosen to disregard the recommendations made by Cultural Services staff and by the Heritage Vaughan Committee.

Attachments

1. Original 1960's bungalow, 695 Nashville Road prior to addition
2. Proposed addition, side elevation, 695 Nashville Road. As approved by Heritage Vaughan, August 2006
3. Proposed addition, front elevation, 695 Nashville Road. As approved by Heritage Vaughan, August 2006. Note flat central gable window
4. As built front elevation, 695 Nashville Road

Report prepared by:

Lauren Archer
Cultural Heritage Coordinator
Recreation and Culture Department

Angela Palermo
Manager of Cultural Services
Recreation and Culture Department

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

**3. 8054 YONGE STREET
HERITAGE REVIEW FORM FOR THE RENOVATION OF FRONT PORCH COLUMNS AND
BALCONY WITHIN THE THORNHILL HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT**

Owner: Wilderman Medical Clinic

Heritage Vaughan advises that they approved the following recommendation:

Recommendation:

1. That Heritage Vaughan approve the proposed work for the renovation of the porch as per the drawings and information included in this report;
2. That the applicant provide two full sets of final drawings, including site plan and all elevations for Cultural Services staff for final approval;
3. That all materials shall be in accordance with section 9.8.1 Building Materials Checklist, Appropriate Materials;
4. That the applicant provides samples of building materials and paint samples for consideration and approval by Cultural Services staff at a time when this information is known to the applicant;
5. That should any changes occur to the proposal as submitted, the applicant is required to contact Cultural Services in order to consult and obtain approval of a revised Heritage Permit; and

**REPORT NO. 8 OF HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 6, 2011**

6. That the deputation of Mr. Len Abelman, 44 Sweet Water Crescent, Richmond Hill, L4S 2A9, on behalf of Wilderman Medical Clinic, be received.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council in the Green Directions, Vaughan, Community Sustainability Environmental Master Plan, Goal 4, Objective 4.1:

- To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage.

Economic Impact

None

Communications Plan

All agenda items and minutes relating to Heritage Vaughan committee meetings are circulated to relevant City departments, applicants and their representatives.

Purpose

To review the drawings and information attached in this report and consider the approval of the proposal for renovation of the front porch for the subject property.

Background - Analysis and Options

1.0 Heritage Status

1.1 The subject property at located at 197 Woodbridge Avenue is designated part V of the Ontario Heritage Act, as it is part of the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District.

1.2 The property is of the Ontario Gothic Vernacular style, a heritage style as identified within the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District Guidelines.

2.0 Current Proposal

The current owner of the property has requested the renovation of the front porch as per attached drawings.

3.0 Analysis

The attached drawings reflect the proposal to renovate the existing porch in the following way:

- introducing new columns to match the original columns as shown in the attached archived photo dating from the 1980's
- the removal of the existing commercial sign to introduce a sympathetic railing design
- introduction of new railings at the front steps.

The materials, although not noted in the drawings, are required to be of an appropriate material as allowed in section 9.8.1 Heritage Buildings, Appropriate materials. The applicant will be required to provide samples of building materials and paint samples for consideration and approval by Cultural Services staff at a time when this information is known to the applicant.

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

In consideration of the strategic priorities related to Vaughan Vision 2020, the report will provide:

**REPORT NO. 8 OF HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 6, 2011**

- STRATEGIC GOAL:
Service Excellence - Providing service excellence to citizens.
- STRATEGIC OBJECTIVES:
Preserve our heritage and support diversity, arts and culture.

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council, and the necessary resources to implement this program have been allocated and approved.

Regional Implications

None

Conclusion

Please refer to recommendation section of this report.

Attachments

1. Location Map
2. 8054 Yonge Street. Image from Google Steet view

Report prepared by:

Cecilia Nin Hernandez
Cultural Heritage Coordinator
Recreation and Culture Department

Angela Palermo
Manager of Cultural Services
Recreation and Culture Department

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

4. VAUGHAN PRESERVATION AWARDS, CALL FOR NOMINATIONS

Heritage Vaughan advises that they approved the following recommendation:

Recommendation

Cultural Services recommends:

1. That the Heritage Vaughan Committee receive the following call for nominations, and consider nominating local heritage individuals and organizations that have made an outstanding contribution to the preservation of heritage and cultural resources in the City of Vaughan for the November 2011 meeting.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council in the Green Directions, Vaughan, Community Sustainability Environmental Master Plan, Goal 4, Objective 4.1:

**REPORT NO. 8 OF HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 6, 2011**

- To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage.

Economic Impact

None

Communications Plan

All agenda items and minutes relating to Heritage Vaughan committee meetings are circulated to relevant City departments, applicants and their representatives.

Purpose

To receive the following call for nominations for the 2011 Vaughan Preservation Awards and consider nominations for the November 2011 meeting of Heritage Vaughan.

Background - Analysis and Options

Heritage Week is celebrated throughout the Province of Ontario every year during the third week of February and provides an opportunity to commemorate the history of communities, its buildings and landmarks, and the people who have contributed to its unique heritage and culture. To celebrate Heritage Week, Heritage Vaughan Committee hosts an event in conjunction with Vaughan Council to recognize individuals for their efforts in the area of heritage conservation in the City of Vaughan.

Council adopted the Vaughan Heritage Preservation Awards program in 1989 to recognize individuals and organizations that have made an outstanding contribution to the preservation of heritage and cultural resources in the City of Vaughan.

Cultural Services staff requests that the Heritage Vaughan Committee consider nominees for the 2011 Vaughan Heritage Preservation Awards, so that they may propose nominees at the next Heritage Vaughan Committee meeting.

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

Reference specific initiative report relates to:

In consideration of the strategic priorities related to Vaughan Vision 2020, the report will provide:

- STRATEGIC GOAL:
Service Excellence - Providing service excellence to citizens.
- STRATEGIC OBJECTIVES:
Preserve our heritage and support diversity, arts and culture.

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council and the necessary resources have been allocated and approved.

Regional Implications

None

**REPORT NO. 8 OF HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 6, 2011**

Conclusion

Cultural Services staff requests that the Heritage Vaughan Committee consider heritage projects completed recently in the City of Vaughan and encourages committee members to nominate any individual or group that they feel has done exceptional work in the area of heritage conservation in the City of Vaughan.

Attachments

None

Report prepared by:

Lauren Archer
Cultural Heritage Coordinator
Recreation and Culture Department

Angela Palermo
Manager of Cultural Services
Recreation and Culture Department

The meeting adjourned at 8:45 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

John Mifsud, Chair

Report prepared by Gloria Hardychuk, Assistant City Clerk