CITY OF VAUGHAN

REPORT NO. 5 OF THE

HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE

For consideration by the Committee of the Whole of the City of Vaughan on June 19, 2012

The Heritage Vaughan Committee met at 7:02 p.m., on May 16, 2012.

- Present: Robert Stitt, Chair Roger Dickinson Rosario Fava Richard Hahn Tony Marziliano Gianni Mignardi Nick Pacione Fadia Pahlawan Christine Radewych Regional Councillor Deb Schulte Councillor Alan Shefman Claudio Travierso (7:45 p.m.)
- Also Present: Cecilia Nin Hernandez, Cultural Heritage Co-ordinator Angela Palermo, Manager of Cultural Services Rose Magnifico, Assistant City Clerk

The following items were dealt with:

1

<u> 141 CENTRE STREET – WARD 5</u>

Heritage Vaughan recommends to Council:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of Cultural Services, dated May 16, 2012, be approved; and
- 2) That the deputation of Mr. Michael Duder, 73 Glengowan Road, Toronto, M4N 1G5, be received.

Recommendation

Cultural Services staff recommend:

1. That the information provided in this report be received.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council in the Green Directions, Vaughan, Community Sustainability Environmental Master Plan, Goal 4, Objective 4.1:

• To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage.

Economic Impact

N/A

Communications Plan

All agenda items and minutes relating to Heritage Vaughan committee meetings are circulated to relevant City departments, applicants and their representatives.

Purpose

To receive the information in this report.

Background and Analysis

Background

This item was deferred from the April 18, 2012 meeting.

The structure at 141 Centre Street is a Registered property under the Ontario Heritage Act. It is known as the Owen McCartney House. It is of the Georgian Style, circa 1840. It features a three bay front elevation arrangement with central front doorway, 12 over 12 and 8 over 12 double hung windows and stucco as exterior cladding. The property is listed on the City's register of buildings under the Ontario Heritage Act; however, it is not included in the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District and therefore not designated under the Ontario Heritage Act.

At the January 2012 Heritage Vaughan Committee meeting, the committee requested that the owner be invited to a future Heritage Vaughan meeting to discuss the building. The owner accepted the invitation for the April 18, 2012 meeting.

At the April 18, 2012 meeting the item was deferred to the May 16, 2012 meeting. The owner accepted the invitation to the May 16, 2012 meeting.

<u>Analysis</u>

141 Centre Street, Thornhill

Description of Property

The property at 141 Centre Street, Ontario, contains a two storey, white stucco house situated at the end of a long driveway which cuts through woods at the front of the same property and that of the adjacent 121 Centre Street property. The house dates back to circa 1840 and reflects design characteristics typical of the Georgian style. The structure

features a boxy massing, with punched windows and a low hip roof with standard overhang. The front façade features the symmetrical arrangement of the windows and entryway in three bays, comprised of the central location of the main door on the ground level, with a divided light window centered on it on the second floor, and a set of windows at each side, one on the ground floor and the other centered on it on the second floor. The building is set back considerably from the street and is screened from view and the Centre Street traffic, by the woods lining the driveway. The simplicity and elegance of the architecture together with the natural setting gives the home a private and stately feel, which has been maintained since its construction.

Statement of Cultural Value or Interest

The cultural heritage value of 141 Centre Street lies in the home on the property being a model example of Georgian architecture, dating from c.1844, within Thornhill's historic core. Its construction is attributed to Esquire Owen McCarthy¹, an Upper Canada pioneer. The home is associated with the life of notable carpenter to the Thornhill community Robert Jarrott, and associated with longtime resident and notable Canadian John S.H Guest, co-founder of Appleby College, Oakville. The house has contextual value as being one of the earliest surviving structures of the original village, thus contributing to the rich history of the area as a pioneer village of former Upper Canada.

Description of Heritage Attributes

The following is a general list of features of cultural heritage value (character defining elements):

- It has the potential to yield information that contributes to the understanding of a community. This house is an excellent example of the domestic Georgian style, constructed as a result of a flow of ideas particular to their time and place as they formed part of a unique and marked time for architectural ideas. The loyalist sentiment of the time adopted the Georgian style as a symbol of loyalty to the British Crown (Kalman 139).
- It is associated with the life of an early pioneer, Owen McCarthy, Robert Jarrott a notable carpenter to the Thornhill community and notable Canadian John S.H Guest co-founder of Appleby College, Oakville
- The building's siting, building envelope, structure, original exterior finish materials all contribute to the following key ideas that the describe the architectural design at 141 Centre Street and are described in the points below:
 - Massing: front portion is rectangular in plan with narrower rectangular two storey tail addition on south façade, two storey and hip roof throughout. The east wall of the addition aligns with the east wall of the original front portion of the house.
 - Front Façade: Symmetry in front façade, aligned arrangement of windows (ground floor with top floor in three bays)

¹ McCarthy's name appears spelled in two ways within the Land Records: McCarty and McCarthy. McCarthy is used throughout the report as it is the spelling used in the signature portion of the Instruments.

- Understated main entry door surround with tapered pilasters of classical style, entablature and cornice
- Roughcast stucco exterior cladding
- $\circ~$ 12 over 12 wood sash windows on ground floor, 8 over 12 pane wood sash windows on the second floor.
- Original window locations and dimensions at front, east and west facades.
- The subject building and siting is important in defining, maintaining and supporting the early 19th century architecture style of early Thornhill at the cusp of its first economic growth, just before the abolition of the Corn Laws in 1846, which impacted the community with the tragic loss of Benjamin Thorne (the man who gave the name to the Village) just four years later and with that the start of twenty years of economic struggle (Fitzgerald, 40-43), and has maintained its Georgian features through history since then.

Architectural Significance – Background Information

The Georgian Style in Upper Canada:

In his book "A History of Canadian Architecture" Kalman tells us that an estimated 7,000 people loyal to the British Crown arrived to portions of today's Ontario and Quebec from the United States as a result of the end of the Independence war fought between the United States and Britain. After the first years of settlement soon the "architecture developed a more consistent and rigorous version of Georgian Classicism, because they found this style to be an effective and appropriate way to articulate for the young province an image that conveyed self -confidence and control, and that declared loyalty to the British Crown and British values" (Kalman 139). The style is referred to as Georgian Classicism because it has classical elements that relate to the architecture of classical antiguity of Rome and Greece, as it was interpreted by the architects in Britain under the span of the years 1714 to 1830 in which the Empire was ruled by Kings George I to IV During this period in British North America an "(Kalman 139 and British Monarchy). architectural style that was simple and adhered "...to conventional rules of symmetry and proportion ... " accented with select and sparse classical details, if any, such as cornices, columns, pilasters, entranceway details, paneled doors and interior paneling (Kalman 139). These details together with the multi-pane double hung design of the windows and the overall simple shaped massing are the most notable features of a Georgian style home. The pioneers that came to Upper Canada continued the tradition as they spread and settled throughout southern Ontario's forests, clearing and following the Humber and its tributaries establishing milling villages where the conditions were suitable such as in Thornhill.

Historical, Associative and Contextual Significance

Ownership History of 141 Centre Street:

The Land Records show that the lands comprehending Concession 1 Lot 30 were first registered as a Crown grant on March 29, 1810 with all 210 acres granted to John Wilson, Senior. He subsequently sold the entire parcel to his son Stilwell Wilson (transaction registered on February 23, 1814) and then to William Allen (registered on May 23, 1822). On July 31, 1823 Henry John Boulton is registered as the grantee for 55

the North East 55 acres on the lot. This transaction marks the first severance of the original 210 acres. These 55 acres where then sold to Daniel Brooke Jr. (registered May 26, 1824). Starting the same year and into the next, he sold severed parts of the 55 acres to 7 different people, including an unspecified amount of acreage to Robert Wiles in 1824 and again in 1825, this time 11 acres were noted (Inst. 5168 registered April 5, 1825). Wiles then sold six acres to Joseph Milburn, registered in September 28, 1829. This parcel passed through several hands including John Vanderburgh, F.D. Hunter (4 acres), Thomas Eliott (4 Acres) William Lane and finally one acre to Owen McCarty (ins. 12923 signed "McCarthy"). This parcel was bought by Robert Jarratt (Reg. May 22, 1846). Robert's last name sometimes appears spelled as "Jarrott". In May 12, 1871 instrument 848 reflects the decision at the Court of Chancery that gives ownership to the parcel to Mary Jane Jarrott . Subsequently, instrument 1102 (reg. 18 May 1872) reflects the decision at the Court of Chancery that gives ownership of two acres to Joseph Cox. Joseph Cox owned the property until his death at which time it was left to the Thornhill Presbyterian Church as specified in his will on October 24, 1928. (Inst. 9160). The trustees of the Thornhill Presbyterian Church sold the property in 1928 to Earl Victor Doan and his wife Vera Doan and held the mortgage until 1935. In 1935 the deed was transferred back to the trustees of the church (Ins. 16976). In December 1937 the property was bought by John and Gladys Guest (only Gladys' name appears in the Instrument). In 1953, Gladys Guest, at that time a widow, sold the property to Edward and Joyce Duder. The Duder family has owned the property since that time.

The Owen McCarthy House: Remnant of an Incipient Thornhill

The Owen McCarthy house is presently identified by the municipal address known as 141 Centre Street in Vaughan within Concession 1, lot 30. Describing its location by lot and Concession is the reference method that was used back between 1792 and 1794 when Governor Simcoe first commissioned the survey of Yonge Street to connect Lake Ontario at York with the lake that would be given his name, Lake Simcoe, and is still used today in the larger scale. The impetus for the growth of the area known today as Thornhill was in fact the making of Yonge Street, opening the path to the settlement of lands to the north of York, together with the favorable milling sites along the Don and Humber Rivers. Starting in 1793, groups of Loyalists started settling along Yonge Street brought by Governor Simcoe who was offering grants of land provided that the land was cleared and a home built with specific conditions to be met. Clearing the land and building a home could take many years of work. This was the case also for Concession 1 Lot 30. (Fitzgerald 13-21).

It was not until 1810 that Lot 30 Concession 1 in its entirety comprising of 210 acres was officially granted to John Wilson Sr., as the first registered private owner of the lot (Land Records, City of Vaughan Archives). He was one of the first Loyalists to move to this area and thought to have been the first miller in the Vaughan area. He came from New Jersey, after spending some initial years in New Brunswick with his wife, two of his four sons and other family members (By-law 21-83 JEH McDonald and Fitzgerald, 18). John Wilson Sr. was Justice of the Peace and "took an active part in local affairs" (Fitzgerald 20). Stilwell Wilson, son of John, was elected overseer of highways, and fence viewer on Yonge Street from lots 26 to 40 in 1799 (Fitzgerald 20). In 1823 the lot was first severed. It is recorded as a "Buy and Sell" transaction when it was registered in July 31. The record indicates that the North East 55 acres of the lot were sold by William Allan to Henry Boulton and subsequently it was divided into several smaller parcels and sold off to new arriving parties. 141 Centre Street as we know it today was part of one of these parcels in which the Owen McCarthy house still stands.

Owen McCarthy was a yeoman, which meant that he was a gentleman-farmer and small estate owner (Genealogy and Ogilvie, 675). Owen McCarthy and his wife Christiana McCarthy sold the 1 acre parcel to Robert Jarrett in 1844 (registered in 1846). Robert had married Susannah Chapman in 1837, thought to be a daughter of Nathan Chapman (Broughton), first settler of lot 28 Concession 1. By 1861 the Jarretts had 12 ½ acres "attached to the tenement" (Broughton, 1861 Census). In 2012, 141 Centre Street is comprised of approximately 1.69 acres.

Corn Laws and their Effect in Thornhill

Around 1810 when John Wilson Sr. officially got the first grant, the area was known by the name of Lyon's Mills. The village changed names a few times and by 1842 it was established as Thornhill, named after Benjamin Thorne, the well known prosperous miller. By the early 1840's when the Owen McCarthy house was built, Thornhill was a very prosperous village hub and the success of Benjamin Thorne's mill was largely a contributor, becoming the most important milling centre north of Toronto (Fitzgerald, 34-40). It had not been without hardship that it achieved this status, however, having survived the cholera outbreak of 1832 that "spread rapidly through Lower and Upper Canada" and divided opinions through the rebellion of 1837. However, in a span of 18 years (1829 to 1847), "the post office, stage coach service, and toll gate were established, four churches, and two schools were built" (Fitzgerald, 40). The real economic test arrived in mid1846 when the Corn Laws were repealed with the effect of opening the British market to grain from all countries. In consequence Benjamin Thorne's mill was ruined by 1848, causing the economy of the Village to suffer greatly from this loss. The decision on the grain tariffs had been impending for a long time. Some residents, such as Owen McCarthy, may have prepared for the worst in the months prior to this event and may have taken their investments elsewhere. He died sometime between May 22, 1846 and December 18, 1847. His son and heir, in December 1847 is recorded as being a resident of Rochester, New York (previously having been a resident of Vaughan) when he sold another acre previously owned by his father, in the same lot and concession in Thornhill to James Hugo of Markham (Ins.no. 30459). Others, such as Benjamin Thorne, were not so prepared, as he had expanded his business in 1843 in Holland Landing, leaving him with large quantities of unsold flour by 1848 (Fitzgerald 40). Robert Jarrett, was the owner of the McCarthy house through the subsequent difficult years that came after 1846 and continued to live in Thornhill to see better years to come in the 1860's making his living as a well respected carpenter and joiner working with Martin (Ins.no. 26886, Broughton 2).

Later Owners

The next owner Joseph Cox and his wife Sara A. Armstrong, was a very involved member in the Thornhill community as member of the Thornhill Presbyterian Church, and willed the estate to the same church, since the couple had no children. After the church's Trustees tried to sell and managed the property for a number of years, sold the property to Gladys Guest and her husband John Guest. John Guest graduated from Corpus Christi College, Cambridge 1897. After working as an assistant master at Upper Canada College since 1901, he became the first headmaster at Upper Canada Preparatory School. Later, with Gladys's father, Sir Edmund Walker, he co-founded Appleby College, a private boys' school in Oakville, in 1911. He served as headmaster until 1934, and moved to the McCarty house the next year and made several renovations including introducing the three part windows in the south façade. The Guests had two sons and two daughters. In 1945 the Guests sold two acres of their parcel to Julia Biriukova, and art teacher in Upper Canada College, originally from Russia, with the Guests keeping the

parcel with the home (Broughton). The Duder family acquired the home form his widow after John Guest passed away in 1953. The Duder family has owned the property for the longest period of time since then.

Sources

Articles:

Broughton, Jim. The Story of 141 Centre Street, The Society for the Preservation of Historic

Thornhill, Newsletter, February 2005.

Books:

Fitzgerald, Doris M. Thornhill 1793-1963, The History of an Ontario Village. Coyright, Canada, 1964, by Doris FitzGerald.

Kalman, Harold. A History of Canadian Architecture, Vol 2. Oxford University Press, Ontario,

1994.

Ogilvie, John. The Imperial Dictionary of the English Language, Vol IV. Blackie and Son, 49

and 50 Old Bailey, E.C. Glasgow, Edinburgh and Dublin, 1883. (digitized by Google).

Reaman, G. Elmore A History of Vaughan Township, Two Centuries of Life in the Township,

University of Toronto Press, 1971.

Land Registry Records and Instruments for Concession 1, Lot 30:

York Region Land Registry Office, 50 Bloomington Rd W, 3rd Floor, Aurora, ON L4G 3G8

The Archives of Ontario, 134 Ian Macdonald Boulevard, Toronto, Ontario, Canada, M7A 2C5

Essay:

Easton, H.Jerry. Thornhill: From Wilderness to Urban Village. Unpublished essay written in 1975. Student at York University.

Web sources:

Genealogy: http://www.genealogy.com/genealogy/Glossary/NEWGLO_Y.html

The Imperial Dictionary of the English Language, Vol IV: http://books.google.ca/books?id=PYICAAAAQAAJ&pg=PA675&dq=dictionary+AND+yeo man+AND+farmer+AND+Canad*&hl=en#v=onepage&q=yeoman&f=false

The Official Website of the British Monarchy: http://www.royal.gov.uk/HistoryoftheMonarchy/KingsandQueensoftheUnitedKingdom/The Hanoverians Wikipedia: http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Corn_Laws

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

In consideration of the strategic priorities related to Vaughan Vision 2020, the report will provide:

• STRATEGIC GOAL:

Service Excellence - Providing service excellence to citizens.

- STRATEGIC OBJECTIVES:
- Preserve our heritage and support diversity, arts and culture.

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council, and the necessary resources to implement this program have been allocated and approved.

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

Please refer to recommendation section of this report.

Attachments

Attachment

Report Prepared by

Cecilia Nin Hernandez Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext 8115 Recreation and Culture Department

Angela Palermo Manager of Cultural Services, ext. 8139 Recreation and Culture Department

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing is on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

2 140 BROOKE STREEET, HOLY TRINITY CHURCH – APPLICATION FOR <u>REPLACEMENT SIDING – WARD 5</u>

Heritage Vaughan recommends to Council:

1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of Cultural Services, dated May 16, 2012, be approved.

Recommendation

Cultural Services recommends:

1. That Heritage Vaughan approve the proposed replacement and restoration of the following:

Front (East) and left (South) side elevations.

- Replace siding on both faces
- Replace quoins
- Replace window frames (reuse existing external glass coverings)
- Clean and repaint 2 front windows inside and out
- Replace soffit and fascia
- Replace trim around main door (leave side doors trim as is)
- Replace eves trough with larger size and additional downcomer(s)
- Replace splash covers at base of walls

Bell Tower:

- Replace siding all around
- Replace soffit and fascia
- Replace eves trough
- Replace shingles on roof
- Replace quoins
- Reuse existing louvers and railing at top.
- 2. That the applicant submit material samples for review and approval by Cultural Services staff when these are available.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council in the Green Directions, Vaughan, Community Sustainability Environmental Master Plan, Goal 4, Objective 4.1:

• To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage.

Economic Impact

N/A

Communications Plan

All agenda items and minutes relating to Heritage Vaughan committee meetings are circulated to relevant City departments, applicants and their representatives.

Purpose

To review the report and provide a recommendation on the item.

Background and Analysis

<u>Analysis</u>

The applicant has proposed the replacement of exterior siding and other exterior cladding features, due to extensive rot and water damage. (Please see Fig 5-6) The applicant intends to only replace the siding on the East and South elevations, as well as on the Bell Tower.

Elements proposed for replacement:

Front (East) and left (South) side elevations.

- Replace siding on both faces
- Replace quoins
- Replace window frames (reuse existing external glass coverings)
- Refurbish 2 front windows inside and out
- Replace soffit and fascia
- Replace trim around main door (leave side doors trim as is)
- Replace eves trough with larger size and additional downcomer(s)
- Replace splash covers at base of walls

Bell Tower:

- Replace siding all around
- Replace soffit and fascia
- Replace eves trough
- Replace shingles on roof
- Replace quoins
- Reuse existing louvers and railing at top.

The applicant will use use Cape Cod wood for all siding, except for the quoins and door trim which will be milled locally to match existing.

Cultural Services recommends the selective replacement of the damaged siding with inkind wood siding, and repainting of the retained wood as the least invasive and most sympathetic choice.

The existing pine wood siding is considered a contributing attribute of the historic character and quality of the Holy Trinity Church. However, the subject wood siding is not an original feature of the building, and was replaced in 1983 with the help of funding from the City of Vaughan.

Cultural Services has no concerns with the proposed work, and as such recommends that Heritage Vaughan approves the subject application.

Background

The property at 140 Brooke Street, Thornhill, Vaughan, the Holy Trinity Church, is individually designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act as well as designated as a part of the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District under part V of the Ontario Heritage Act. The subject property is also included in the *Listing of Buildings of Architectural and*

REPORT NO. 5 OF HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON JUNE 19, 2012

Historical Value, the City of Vaughan's Register of Property of Cultural Heritage Value as per Part IV, and Subsection 27 of the Ontario Heritage Act.

Built in 1830 by Benjamin Thorne and William Parsons, the Holy Trinity Anglican Church is an excellent example of Georgian church architecture, and is the oldest original church still in use in the Anglican Diocese of Toronto. The church was relocated from its original location at Yonge St. and Royal Orchard Boulevard in 1950 due to the widening of Yonge Street.

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

In consideration of the strategic priorities related to Vaughan Vision 2020, the report will provide:

- STRATEGIC GOAL:
 Service Excellence Providing service excellence to citizens.
- STRATEGIC OBJECTIVES:
 Preserve our heritage and support diversity, arts and culture.

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council, and the necessary resources to implement this program have been allocated and approved.

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

Please refer to recommendation section of this report.

Attachment

Attachments

Report prepared by:

Lauren Archer Cultural Heritage Coordinator ext. 8112 Recreation and Culture Department

Angela Palermo Manager of Cultural Services, ext. 8139 Recreation and Culture Department

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing is on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

150 BROOKE STREET – WARD 5

Heritage Vaughan recommends to Council:

1) That the following be approved:

3

- 1. That Heritage Vaughan approve the proposed drawings presented at the May 16, 2012 Heritage Vaughan meeting as attached to Communication C1 of the agenda and circulated by the applicant in an email to the residents on May 15, 2012 showing a revised building height of 8.36 m and a reduction of 6' 10" and the removal of the verandah roof for a revised Heritage Permit subject to the following;
 - That the builder/owner provide landscape screening to obscure the basement door on the west elevation and window and mature and continuous landscaping screening be provided along the complete south and west sides of the property at 150 Brooke Street;
 - That the builder/owner negotiate the proposed landscaping treatment to the satisfaction of the adjacent neighbours;
 - That the builder/owner submit a revised landscaping and screening plan reflecting the agreement reached with the adjacent neighbours and that staff obtain confirmation that the neighbours approve the plan;
- 2. That the applicant submit material samples for review and approval by Cultural Services staff when these are available;
- 3. The applicant is to be advised that if the design changes as a result of addressing issues from review by other departments, a new submittal for review for the Heritage Vaughan Committee may be required and any previous approval granted may be deemed invalid based on the new information provided; and
- 2) That the report of Cultural Services, dated May 16, 2012, be received;
- 3) That Communication C1, from the Manager of Culture, dated May 16, 2012, be received; and
- 4) That the following deputations be received:
 - 1. Mr. Matt Creador, 1681 Langstaff Road, Vaughan, L4K 5T3; and
 - 2. Mr. Stan Bertoia, 148 Brooke Street, Thornhill, L4J 1Y9.

Recommendation

Cultural Services recommends:

- 1. Heritage Vaughan approve the proposed drawings dated April 12, 2012 (as revised and presented at the May 16, 2012 meeting) for a revised Heritage Permit subject to the following;
- That the owner/applicant meet with the neighbours to discuss the revised latest proposal and that a summary of those discussion be provided to Culture staff by the residents and the applicant for staff's review to determine if new information

needs to be provided to Heritage Vaughan at this meeting or the next meeting for consideration of the final approval of the Heritage Permit; and,

- This review with the neighbours should be done prior to the final release of the revised Heritage Permit by Cultural Services staff; and,
- 2. That the applicant submit material samples for review and approval by Cultural Services staff when these are available; and,
- 3. The applicant is to be advised that if the design changes as a result of addressing issues from review by other departments, a new submittal for review for the Heritage Vaughan Committee may be required and any previous approval granted may be deemed invalid based on the new information provided.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council in the Green Directions, Vaughan, Community Sustainability Environmental Master Plan, Goal 4, Objective 4.1:

• To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage.

Economic Impact

N/A

Communications Plan

All agenda items and minutes relating to Heritage Vaughan committee meetings are circulated to relevant City departments, applicants and their representatives.

<u>Purpose</u>

To receive and consider the presentation by the applicant.

Background and Analysis

Analysis of Latest Drawings Dated April 18, 2012

The following is a summary of proposed changes as reflected in the latest drawings dated April 12, 2012:

- front covered porch will be eliminated by reconstruction of the front portion of the roof approximately 4 feet back from originally proposed/built.
- Slope of the back dormer will be continued to intersect the current roof plane and bring down the ridge height. This slope is different from the slope of the front portion of the roof.
- Ridge height has been brought down a total of 5'-1" from originally built
- The height to the midpoint of the roof is now noted as 8.63 metres. (originally approved height was 8.99 metres)

Zoning has advised that the proposed coverage complies with the by-law and that the variances will not be required for these changes.

The changes are generally consistent with the California bungalow heritage style precedent followed and therefore consistent with the intent of the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District Guidelines. The form resulting from the two different slopes meeting at the ridge is not consistent with the precedent style as it results in a half gambrel roof with different slopes on each side. Looking at the roof form on its own, it would improve the design if the back roof slope match that of the front and it meet at the ridge height proposed. This may result in the back dormer look larger and exacerbate the view of the third floor towards the MacDonald property and back view in general. The site presents a natural slope downwards towards the back already enhancing the actual height of the structure. Given this site condition, the proposed design mitigates well between the neighbour's concerns and the site conditions in this instance.

Background

The applicant has a Heritage Permit issued in July 2011. In March 2012 a Committee of Adjustment application was circulated for comment in order to deal with changes to the approved permit. This application was reviewed by Heritage Vaughan at their March meeting. The outcome of the meeting was communicated to the Committee of Adjustment in a memorandum dated March 23, 2012 including the following comments:

The subject property is within the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District and therefore the property is designated Part V under the Ontario Heritage Act. All proposed changes to cultural heritage resources must be reviewed and approved by Cultural Services and Heritage Vaughan Committee through the Heritage Permit process.

At their meeting of March 21, 2012, the Heritage Vaughan Committee approved the following recommendation regarding the subject Committee of Adjustment application (Please refer to Report No.3 of the Heritage Vaughan Committee to Council attached):

Heritage Vaughan recommends to Council:

1) That Heritage Vaughan is not prepared to approve any variances beyond what was approved by Heritage Vaughan in March 2011; and

Therefore Heritage Vaughan recommends to the Committee of Adjustment that the variance not be approved;

- 2) That the report of Cultural Services, dated March 21, 2012, be received; and
- 3) That the following deputations and communications be received:
 - 1. *Mr. Matthew Corridore, representing the applicant;*
 - 2. *Mr.* and *Mrs.* Stan and Marisa Bertoia, neighbour, and Communication C2 and C3, dated March 20, 2012; and
 - 3. Ms. Toby Hahn, applicant.

The applicant requested to be included in the April 18, 2012 Heritage Vaughan meeting upon revising the drawings and meetings with the local residents. The revised drawings were presented at the Committee meeting in April 2012 by the applicant. The following resolution was approved by the Committee at that time:

Heritage Vaughan recommends:

- 1) That the property owner and the neighbours continue discussions regarding mutually agreeable final revisions to the property and that revised drawings be provided to Heritage Vaughan once finalized;
- 2) That the report of Cultural Services, dated April 18, 2012, be received; and
- 3) That the following deputations and Communications be received:
 - 1. *Mr. Matthew Corridore, representing the applicant, and Communication C3, revised drawings;*
 - 2. Mr. Stan Bertoia, 148 Brooke Street, Thornhill, L4J 1Y9, and Communications C4, C5, dated April 18, 2012, and C6, from Ms. Susan Logue; and
 - 3. Mr. Chuck Snowdon, 151 Brook Street, Thornhill, L4J 1Y9.

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

In consideration of the strategic priorities related to Vaughan Vision 2020, the report will provide:

STRATEGIC GOAL:
 Service Excellence - Providing service excellence to citizens.

Service Excellence - Providing Service excellence to citiz

STRATEGIC OBJECTIVES:

Preserve our heritage and support diversity, arts and culture.

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council, and the necessary resources to implement this program have been allocated and approved.

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

Please refer to recommendation section of this report.

Attachment

Attachments

Report prepared by:

Cecilia Nin Hernandez Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115 Recreation and Culture Department

Angela Palermo Manager of Cultural Services, ext. 8139 Recreation and Culture Department (A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing is on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

Heritage Vaughan member Richard Hahn declared an interest with respect to this matter as he is the property owner and applicant, and did not take part in the discussion or vote on the matter.

4

8 LEASTER B. PEARSON – APPLICATION TO ALTER ROOFLINE NEW PORCH AND RECLADING, WITHING THE KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE HERITAGE <u>CONSERVATION DISTRICT – WARD 1</u>

Heritage Vaughan recommends to Council:

1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of Cultural Services, dated May 16, 2012, be approved.

Recommendation

Cultural Services recommends:

- 1. That Heritage Vaughan approve the proposed alterations which utilize the Historical Conversion approach, reflecting the Regency style.
- 2. That the applicant submit material samples for review and approval by Cultural Services staff when these are available.
- 3. That the applicant advise Cultural Services staff if any further alterations are to be made, and submit revised plans for review by Cultural Services staff.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council in the Green Directions, Vaughan, Community Sustainability Environmental Master Plan, Goal 4, Objective 4.1:

• To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage.

Economic Impact

N/A

Communications Plan

All agenda items and minutes relating to Heritage Vaughan committee meetings are circulated to relevant City departments, applicants and their representatives.

Purpose

To review the report and provide a recommendation on the item.

Background and Analysis

<u>Analysis</u>

The subject structure is a small, one storey cottage at the corner of Nashville Road and Lester B. Pearson Street. The building consists of a main house, with hipped roof and several flat roof additions to the side and rear. (Please see Fig. 1-4)

The structure is not of any recognizable heritage architectural style as per the Heritage Conservation District Guidelines.

In December 2010 Cultural Services completed a Built Heritage Evaluation (See attached BHE.) for the subject property, at the request of the applicant, who at that time indicated an interest in demolishing the house.

Cultural Services staff completed a Built Heritage Evaluation for the subject structure, and recommended, based on the results of this BHE, that the demolition of the existing building be allowed. Cultural Services also recommended that the replacement construction be of a Heritage Style as described in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Guidelines, and be in keeping with the heritage character of Kleinburg-Nashville.

Based on the scale and massing of the existing structure, Cultural Services recommended in particular that the Regency style be pursued as identified in the Kleinburg-Nashville HCD Guidelines, and that ideally the replacement construction be 1 to 1 1/2 storeys.

The applicant has decided not to pursue demolition, but rather have opted for Historic Conversion, an approach described in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Guidelines as a suitable way to add onto existing Non-heritage buildings within the District.

The applicant has chosen to imitate to Regency style, as per Cultural Services recommendation (See Fig. 5-12).

Alterations to the existing structure include:

New Roof:

A new hipped roof will be installed, to cover the entire existing structure. The current roof is hipped, but does not include the rear and side additions, which currently have a flat roof. Hipped roofs are typical of the Regency architectural style.

Wraparound Porch:

The applicant is proposing a new covered wraparound porch around the south side and front elevations. There currently is a covered are on the south side elevation that is used as a carport. The new verandah includes historically appropriate

Gable portico:

The proposed alterations include the installation of two gabled portico areas, on the south side and front elevations. This gabled portico is similar to the front gable found in Regency style homes.

New exterior cladding - Board and Batten:

New replacement windows. Existing windows are 1/1 aluminum and not original. It is not clear form the drawings id the subject windows are 1/1 single or double hung sash windows. Window styles are required to be sash windows, and open in a traditional way. Windows should also either be of wood or of acceptable alternative.

New address panel:

The proposed address panel. Is proposed to be of a hardie board panel. Cultural Services has no concerns with the subject panel.

New replacement side door:

The applicant has proposed a two panel door. This style of door is compatible with the Regency style, however, a 6 panel door would be more appropriate.

Cultural Services supports the proposed historical conversion approach. The proposed design and materials are consistent with the historic precedent and in keeping with the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Guidelines, and as such, Cultural Services recommends that the proposed alterations be approved.

Background

The subject building is located within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District. Parts of the subject building were constructed as early as circa 1900, and many subsequent additions have been made to the subject building between the 1920-1970s. The subject structure currently most closely resembles the Regency Architectural Style as described in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District.

As an existing non-heritage home, the K-N HCD guidelines recommend that any alterations to the subject building be either in keeping with the original style, which is not known in this case, or be in keeping and consistent with a heritage architectural style.

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

In consideration of the strategic priorities related to Vaughan Vision 2020, the report will provide:

- STRATEGIC GOAL: Service Excellence - Providing service excellence to citizens.
- STRATEGIC OBJECTIVES:
 Preserve our heritage and support diversity, arts and culture.

REPORT NO. 5 OF HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON JUNE 19, 2012

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council, and the necessary resources to implement this program have been allocated and approved.

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

Please refer to recommendation section of this report.

Attachment

Attachments

Report prepared by:

Lauren Archer Cultural Heritage Coordinator ext. 8112 Recreation and Culture Department

Angela Palermo Manager of Cultural Services, ext. 8139 Recreation and Culture Department

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing is on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

5

9000 BATHURST STREET – APPLICATION FOR DEMOLITION OF REAR LATER SCHOOL ADDITIONS, RETENTION OF THE HISTORIC MAIN BUILDING – WARD 4

Heritage Vaughan recommends to Council:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of Cultural Services, dated May 16, 2012, be approved; and
- 2) That the deputation of Mr. Kurt Franklin, Weston Consulting Group, 201 Millway Avenue, Suite 19, Vaughan, L4K 5K8, be received.

Recommendation

Cultural Services recommends:

- 1. That Heritage Vaughan approve the proposed demolition of later rear and side school additions, as proposed.
- 2. That the applicant secure the subject building before, during and after demolition to protect from vandalism and environmental damage.
- 3. That the full revitalization of the subject structure be included as a part of any future Planning or Building Permit application for the subject property.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council in the Green Directions, Vaughan, Community Sustainability Environmental Master Plan, Goal 4, Objective 4.1:

• To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage.

Economic Impact

N/A

Communications Plan

All agenda items and minutes relating to Heritage Vaughan committee meetings are circulated to relevant City departments, applicants and their representatives.

Purpose

To review the report and provide a recommendation on the item.

Background and Analysis

<u>Analysis</u>

The applicant has proposed the demolition of the rear and side school additions, with the retention of the historic original main building. Please see below for an architectural description of each of the parts of this structure, as well as the Attachments for images and a shaded floor plan showing areas to be demolished (solid grey), and areas to be retained (hatched grey).

Areas of the school that appear in white are to be retained temporarily, while additional research is completed to determine the best course of action for separating the school from the historic main building.

Initially, the applicant was applying for the demolition of the entire structure.

Cultural Services performed a site visit to complete a Built Heritage Evaluation of the property in January 2012. Since this time the applicant has decided to retain the historic portion of the house, and demolish only the later school additions at the rear.

The subject property was bought in 1994 by the Islamic Shia Ithna-Asheri Jamaat of Toronto, who converted the structure into a school. The building was used for education until 2008 when a new school was built on the property to the rear of the existing structure. The subject building has been vacant for the past 4 years, used primarily for storage. Despite regular security patrols there have been several break-ins and several fires lit in the rear institutional portion of the building. In December 2010 a pipe burst in the rear addition and the basement flooded.

Since Cultural Services has completed their assessment, the applicant has been informed by their insurance provider that the old structure is a high risk, and their insurance has gone up considerably. As such, the applicant is seeking the demolition of

just the unsympathetic rear and side addition portions of the subject building to reduce this risk.

The intent is for the main original house to eventually be revitalized as a part of the new school on the site.

Cultural Services supports the retention of the original Georgian Revival structure at its original location.

Background

The property at 9000 Bathurst Street is included in the Listing of Buildings of Architectural and Historical Value, the City of Vaughan's Register of Property of Cultural Heritage Value as per Part IV, Subsection 27 of the Ontario Heritage Act (as approved by Council on June 27, 2005). The property contains a Georgian Revival home c.1928, with multiple additions to the rear. The house was used as a hobby farm before it was converted to a hospital in 1959. The hospital was phased out starting in 1988, and the property was bought in 1994 by the Islamic Shia Ithna-Asheri Jamaat of Toronto, who converted the structure into a school. The building was used for education until 2008 when a new school was built on the same property to the rear of the existing structure. Please see the attached Built Heritage Evaluation for a full history and analysis of the subject structure.

Registered buildings are protected by law and shall be preserved. The demolition of Registered requires the approval of a Heritage Permit application in addition to other City permits such as Building Permits or Planning Application approvals.

Architectural Description:

The subject building is a good example of a Georgian Revival style estate home built c. 1928, and one of the only remaining of its kind in the City of Vaughan. The complex consists of many different layers of construction, starting with the original house, built in 1928.

Main House:

The main house consists of the central rectangular house, with two side wings, and one rear tail addition, all in keeping with the Georgian tradition.

Significant architectural features include:

- Central rectangular plan, with two side wings.
- Symmetrical facade
- Moderately pitched gable roof.
- Simple design, without extensive ornamentation
- Ornamentation is Neo-classical where it is found, such as in the cornice, entablature banding, columns and door surround.
- 2 ¹/₂ storey, with rear facing Georgian style dormers.
- Side gable roofline with squared cornice at main house and cornice returns on side wing additions.
- Symmetrical front façade
- 6/6 Wood windows throughout, with 4/4 sidelights on main house
- Wood transom entranceway with sidelights.

- Traditional stucco cladding
- 4 Georgian influenced stucco-clad chimneys
- Side wing entablature banding, which extends around to the rear of the building.
- Doric order columns on north side wing addition. This is possibly originally a garage or drive through access to the rear of the property. This porte-cochere appears to have been filled in some time after the postcard image (See attached) was taken.
- Neo-classical second storey rear balcony.
- Heavy concrete steps leading to entranceway.

Side Joining Addition:

To the south of the main house there is a low, 1 storey addition, connected to the main house by a flat roof institutional U-shaped addition to the rear of the building.

Notable architectural features include:

- Shallow pitched front gable façade
- central entranceway
- Symmetrical façade
- Large square roof peak 'schoolhouse' vent
- Traditional stucco cladding

Rear Institutional Additions:

To the rear of the building is a large 1 storey, U-Shaped institutional addition, with basement. The structure is typical of a 1960s-1970s school or hospital structure.

Notable architectural features include:

Flat roof

- Large bowed aluminum picture windows on all elevations
- Traditional stucco cladding
- Aluminum fascia, soffits
- Rear flat roof overhang

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

In consideration of the strategic priorities related to Vaughan Vision 2020, the report will provide:

STRATEGIC GOAL:

Service Excellence - Providing service excellence to citizens.

STRATEGIC OBJECTIVES:

Preserve our heritage and support diversity, arts and culture.

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council, and the necessary resources to implement this program have been allocated and approved.

REPORT NO. 5 OF HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON JUNE 19, 2012

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

Please refer to recommendation section of this report.

Attachment

Attachments

Report prepared by:

Lauren Archer Cultural Heritage Coordinator ext. 8112 Recreation and Culture Department

Angela Palermo Manager of Cultural Services, ext. 8139 Recreation and Culture Department

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing is on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

6

10391 ISLINGTON AVENUE, KLEINBURG PUBLIC SCHOOL FOUR-PACK PORTABLE INSTALLATION – WARD 1

Heritage Vaughan recommends to Council:

1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of Cultural Services, dated May 16, 2012, be approved.

Recommendation

Cultural Services recommends:

- 1. That Heritage Vaughan approve the proposed four-pack portable installation on the subject site.
- 2. That the applicant advise Cultural Services staff if any further alterations are to be made, and submit revised plans for review by Cultural Services staff.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council in the Green Directions, Vaughan, Community Sustainability Environmental Master Plan, Goal 4, Objective 4.1:

• To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage.

Economic Impact

N/A

Communications Plan

All agenda items and minutes relating to Heritage Vaughan committee meetings are circulated to relevant City departments, applicants and their representatives.

Purpose

To review the report and provide a recommendation on the item.

Background and Analysis

<u>Analysis</u>

The applicant, York Region District School Board, is proposing the installation of a four pack set of portable classrooms to the rear of the existing school. Please see the attached for the site plan and images of the proposed portable design.

Cultural Services has no concerns regarding the proposed portables as they are temporary in nature and are located to the rear of the property.

Background

The subject property is located within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District, and as such, all alterations to the subject property will require the review of Heritage Vaughan and the approval of a Heritage Permit.

The subject building is a school, built in a contemporary style.

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

In consideration of the strategic priorities related to Vaughan Vision 2020, the report will provide:

STRATEGIC GOAL:
 Service Excellence - Providing service excellence to citizens.

STRATEGIC OBJECTIVES:
 Preserve our heritage and support diversity, arts and culture.

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council, and the necessary resources to implement this program have been allocated and approved.

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

Please refer to recommendation section of this report.

Attachment

Attachments

Report prepared by:

Lauren Archer Cultural Heritage Coordinator ext. 8112 Recreation and Culture Department

Angela Palermo Manager of Cultural Services, ext. 8139 Recreation and Culture Department

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing is on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

7 7814 KIPLING AVENUE – PROPOSED NEW FRONT PORCH WITHIN THE WOODBRIDGE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT

Heritage Vaughan recommends to Council:

1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of Cultural Services, dated May 16, 2012, be approved.

Recommendation

Cultural Services recommends:

- 3. That Heritage Vaughan approve the proposed new covered porch, with the following changes:
 - A 4" border be included on the base of the porch, surrounding the proposed board and batten.
 - The fascia below the roof of the proposed porch, with horizontal metal cladding, be typical pre-painted metal fascia.
 - The board and batten treatment be excluded from the front face of the building foundation.
- 4. That the applicant submit material samples for review and approval by Cultural Services staff when these are available.
- 5. That the applicant advise Cultural Services staff if any further alterations are to be made, and submit revised plans for review by Cultural Services staff.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council in the Green Directions, Vaughan, Community Sustainability Environmental Master Plan, Goal 4, Objective 4.1:

• To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage.

Economic Impact

N/A

Communications Plan

All agenda items and minutes relating to Heritage Vaughan committee meetings are circulated to relevant City departments, applicants and their representatives.

Purpose

To review the report and provide a recommendation on the item.

Background and Analysis

<u>Analysis</u>

The applicant has proposed the installation of larger covered porch. The property owner has made an application to the Committee of Adjustment to permit the installation of an underground cold storage area at the front of the house. This Committee of Adjustment application was approved.

The porch foundation represents the area of the new cold storage, and has already been poured as a part of foundation and structural reinforcement that has already been completed. (See Fig. 7-8) The new porch is required to cover the new cold storage area. The applicant has worked with Cultural Services staff to design a new porch for the subject building.

In general, the proposed porch is in keeping with the existing architectural style and is an appropriate addition to the subject Edwardian home.

Cultural Services recommends the proposed porch be approved, with following amendments (See Fig.1-2):

• The board and batten treatment be excluded from the front face of the building foundation.

The applicant has indicated a preference for leaving the board and batten as proposed, to create a unified foundation frontage.

- A 4" border be included on the base of the porch, surrounding the proposed board and batten.
- The fascia below the roof of the proposed porch, with horizontal metal cladding, be typical repainted fascia.

Background

The subject property is located within the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District, and as such, all alterations to the subject property will require the review of Heritage Vaughan and the approval of a Heritage Permit.

The subject building is identified as an Edwardian style building, and is identified as a Contributing building within the district.

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

In consideration of the strategic priorities related to Vaughan Vision 2020, the report will provide:

- STRATEGIC GOAL:
 Service Excellence Providing service excellence to citizens.
- STRATEGIC OBJECTIVES:
 Preserve our heritage and support diversity, arts and culture.

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council, and the necessary resources to implement this program have been allocated and approved.

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

Please refer to recommendation section of this report.

Attachment

Attachments

Report prepared by:

Lauren Archer Cultural Heritage Coordinator ext. 8112 Recreation and Culture Department

Angela Palermo Manager of Cultural Services, ext. 8139 Recreation and Culture Department

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing is on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

<u>NEW BUSINESS – AUXILIARY BUILDINGS</u>

Heritage Vaughan advises that the following was approved:

- That Culture staff when reviewing development applications and committee of adjustment applications take into consideration the impact of large auxiliary buildings being proposed for properties abutting Vaughan's heritage conservation districts and their possible negative impact to the streetscape and in turn the heritage conservation district; and
- 2) That Culture staff provide comments to the Planning Department and Committee of Adjustment on any negative impact these large buildings will have to the heritage conservation district.

The foregoing matter was brought to the attention of the Committee by Claudio Travierso.

The meeting adjourned at 8:50 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Robert Stitt, Chair

8

Report Prepared by: Rose Magnifico, Assistant City Clerk